Art and Religion: Theology, the sacred, and visual culture

Ben Quash, King's College London

Ayla Lepine, University of Essex

When art enters religious territory, it can open new spaces of encounter that provoke, illuminate, challenge, and disturb. The attachments of religious conviction, meanwhile, can discomfit the disinterested analysis of the scholar of material culture. When scholarship in art history connects with research in religious studies and theology, dialogues necessarily open outwards, therefore, onto debates regarding religion and the sacred in visual culture and in public and private life. Building on recent scholarship by voices in theology, religion and the arts, including Sally Promey, Graham Howes, Gretchen Buggeln and Christopher Pinney, this session encourages new perspectives on diverse meetings worldwide between the sacred and the arts.

Across the past decade, art historians and theologians have begun to probe new zones of common ground and collaborate fruitfully. As an example, Stations 2016, staged in London during Lent 2016, was a remarkable but almost uncategorisable event. It created a route across London which connected works of art hanging in museum spaces (Jacopo Bassano's *Christ on the Way to Calvary* in the National Gallery, for example, or a Limoges enamel sequence in the Wallace Collection) with works of art in church spaces (many of them newly commissioned, temporary installations), and also with works of art in public and ostensibly 'neutral' spaces (such as a statue of Mahatma Gandhi in Parliament Square). It clearly showed that contexts are not only physical spaces; they are also human uses. The Bassano in the National Gallery could, at the very same instant that Lent, have been gazed upon by a tourist spending a morning enjoying art for art's sake, and a pilgrim en route with Christ to Golgotha.

This session features papers from art historians and theologians in fields that explore any tradition or period in which art and religion interlace to produce new experiences and understandings of holiness and the sacred. These researchers break new ground in relation to liturgy and ritual, interdisciplinary methodologies and cross-fertilizations between theology and art history. The explore the unique status of religious objects in museums and cultural institutions, interactions between sacred scripture and the arts, religious implications for representational and abstract art, diverse intersections of gender, identity, and religious art, and the capacity of art to break boundaries regarding conventional understandings of 'religion' and 'faith'.

Spike Bucklow (University of Cambridge)

The Rood Screen – Gateway to paradise

Details of the liturgy in English churches have varied significantly. However, their visual backdrop has been remarkably consistent for centuries. A survey of over 500 churches shows that the laity usually faced chancels through rood screens that were predominantly red and green. Access – whether bodily, vicariously or visually – to the chancel from the nave was

through a construction of rigorously alternating colours. The red-and-green scheme was revived in the 19th century and this paper will consider the associations it could have held for speculatively inclined members of 14th- to 17th-century congregations.

The paper starts from the commonly held cosmological understanding of colour as a key part of the Doctrine of Signatures, which was relevant to healthcare and the general ordering of Creation. Many members of the congregation would have been familiar with the pigments used to paint rood screens, since those same materials were used as everyday medicines. The apparently anomalous use of colours – exclusively asymmetrical, on symmetrical structures – would have caught the attention and may have prompted conjectures upon the nature of paired red-and-green.

The paper concludes that decorative patterns could be as meaningful as figurative paintings in religious contexts. It suggests that the use of colour on rood screens was consistent with their ritual function as permeable boundaries between spaces of different relative sanctity. It also points to the existence of a profound dimension in the widely recognized religious role of craft guilds.

Honor Wilkinson (Bowdoin College Museum of Art)

The Journey to Divine Understanding in the Architectural Diagrams of Richard of St Victor's In visionem Ezechielis

This paper will examine Richard of St Victor's unique 12th-century visual representations of Prophet Ezekiel's vision of the Temple of Jerusalem (Ezekiel 40-48) as the means of his literal exegesis. In contrast to the previous standard of allegorical interpretations of Ezekiel's vision, Richard composed a manuscript that utilised spatial diagrams as manifestations of the literal Word. The categorisation of Richard's work as 'literal' often leads scholarly analyses of the work to focus on his detailed examination of Ezekiel's provided measurements. These analyses of Richard's work limit the significance of his architectural renderings to illustration, however, failing to recognise the novel function of Richard's images as representations of historic fact and as tools of contemplation. This paper will analyse Richard's visual representations of scripture in relation to his theological concepts of contemplation and speculation, analysing the composition of images and their reflection and their creation of three parallel journeys to spiritual enlightenment: Ezekiel's journey through the Temple, the viewer's journey through the manuscript, and Richard's journey through the images. Emerging from a strong Victorine belief in understanding the literal, material world to reach a higher, spiritual understanding, Richard's spatial images – as embodiments of the literal Word – act as gateways to divine enlightenment. This paper will argue that medieval viewers of Richard's *In visionem Ezechielis* could have interpreted these spatial images as representations of both the historic truth in the visible realm, and the divine truth in the invisible realm.

Whitney Davis (Berkeley)

Presence and Scepticism

In phenomenological psychology, the history of religion, the anthropology of images, and other inquiries, an influential theory of 'presence' has come to displace representationalist accounts of depiction and iconicity. When an initiate in shamanistic visionary practices encountered a 'picture' of the transformational avatar – of a bison in the case of Upper Paleolithic painted caves; of an eland in the case of southern San (African) rock art; of a raven in the case of the indigenous Kwakwaka'wakw (Kwakiutl) mask-dancing of the coast of British Columbia – they didn't see it *as* a picture (a painting, a sculpture, a mask operated with hinges and strings); it was the very presence of the sacred being. Or so a 'strong' version of this theory of presence would have it. At the same time, devotees – participants in the initiation – are well aware that the 'presences' are human-made artefacts and performances. Moreover, different participants in the performances have different levels of belief, of initiate 'mystical' knowledge. (In the Kwakwaka'wakw case, the very names given to the sacred beings danced by the masked performers – 'raven' or 'whale', for example – varied by one's family affiliation, and of course by one's membership in a 'secret society'.) And at least some participants in the performance of presence can be supposed to be *non-* or *dis*believers – representationalist sceptics, as it were. Building on some arguments developed in my *Visuality and Virtuality* (Princeton, 2017), the paper addresses the role of scepticism in the very production of presence, considering such questions as the sensory distribution of scepticism (while vision accepts 'presence', touch discovers artifice) and the distribution of its agency (as indexing the 'prototype', the sacred being, or as indexing the maker, the artificer, or both, to use the terms of Alfred Gell's anthropology of art).

Helena Capkova (Waseda University)

Golconde as Concrete Crystal of Caves: A case of transnational intentional community architecture

Golconde Dormitory (1935–c.1948) in Puducherry, India is oftentimes hailed as the first modernist building in the country, yet it is also a prime example among projects that highlight potentialities identified in the relationship between architects and intentional communities. This paper's aim is to analyse the complex relationship between client and architect (Sri Aurobindo Ashram commissioned Antonín Raymond atelier in Japan to design the building) in terms of negotiating ideas that were intimate to both parties: the spiritual commitments. Antonín Raymond (1888–1976) and his wife and co-designer Noémi P Raymond (1889–1983), were active participants in architectural, spiritual, and Theosophical networks in Japan in the interwar period.

I will argue that behind the successful execution of this project lie harmonious resonances in terms of admiration for Japan and Japanese aesthetics and involvement with European esotericisms. The points of negotiation or tension, which will be explored here, were to do with Theosophy, or rather Theosophical Society and local Indian spiritual tradition and practices.

The rich transnational interaction that produced the construction and elaborated maintenance programme of the dormitory prompted the ashram members to create a compact "exoskeleton" of writing that obscures some details of the building process, yet remains the key resource for scholars outside the ashram interested in the subject. Using transnational methodology, this body of writing will be deconstructed as a part of this paper.

Hannah Williams (Queen Mary, University of London)

Sacred Space in the City of Enlightenment: Following religious art through 18th-century Paris

In 1767, Joseph-Marie Vien's *Saint Denis Preaching to the Gauls* and Gabriel Doyen's *Saint Geneviève and the Miracle of the Ardents* made their Paris debuts as hits of the Salon exhibition. Throughout the summer run, both paintings were discussed at length by the critics, and admired or derided by the city's crowds of contemporary art connoisseurs. Then, at the end of the Salon, the two enormous canvases were removed from the exhibition space in the Louvre, transported a few hundred metres down the Rue Saint-Honoré, and relocated to the site for which they had always been intended: the transept chapels in the parish church of Saint-Roch.

How can a painting be an item in a 'secular' exhibition one day and the next become an object of religious devotion? What does the journey of these paintings (and so many others like them) – from exhibition-piece to altarpiece – tell us about the polyvalency of religious objects and the permeability of sacred space in 18th century France? In this paper I follow Vien and Doyen's paintings through Paris to explore ideas of 'sacredness' at a moment that has come to hold a crucial place in histories of secularism. Arguing against conventional narratives, I show how an engagement with religious material culture challenges the pervasive idea of the 18th century as the turning point of secularisation, dismantling anachronistic divisions between sacred and secular with the dexterous abilities of artworks to exist simultaneously as aesthetic and liturgical objects.

Catherine McCormack (Sotheby's Institute of Art)

Relic as Image and Image as Relic: The body of St Teresa of Avila in Rome

In 1617 the relic of the right foot of the Spanish nun St Teresa of Avila arrived in Rome. Later in the 17th-century, Girolamo Frezza produced an undated devotional print pertaining to be the 'vera misura' of the same body part. This paper brings these two objects together (that have thus far been invisible in scholarship), to consider the sorts of questions that imaging the relic might bring to light during a critical phase of change in the early modern episteme. It argues that the printed image queries the ontological claims of the relic in new ways, by suggesting that the image reflects contemporary practices of anatomical dissection and thus invites a subsequent slippage between viewing the relic as a sacred fragment and as an anatomical specimen. This paper suggests that the printed image challenges the entanglement of body and soul that was embodied in theological concepts concerning relics, as constructs of 'mind' and 'matter' came to be understood as separate entities. The second part of the paper suggests that Frezza's print draws the relic into a visual dialectic with

contemporary images in 17th-century Rome, including Bernini's sculpture *St Teresa in Ecstasy* (1644) and Stefano Maderno's sculpture of *St Cecilia* (1600), again exploring the interface between traditional art image and thaumaturgical object in new provocative ways.

Jonathan Anderson (Biola University)

The Retrieval of Theology in the Artworks of Kris Martin

With increasing frequency over the past two decades, European artists have been exploring the enduring significance of Christianity in contemporary visual culture and in the European 'social imaginary'. Prominent Belgian artist Kris Martin, for example, has been particularly influential. Familiar Christian themes, forms, and structures appear consistently in Martin's works, though almost always in compromised states: vacant altarpieces, unreadable texts, broken statuary, decommissioned church bells. The compromised character of the Christian iconographic tradition in his works highlights a vacating of religious belief in his own society, while also acknowledging and reactivating enduring structures of belief in his post-Christian context. For Martin, these works are neither cynical nor nostalgic; they are poignant attempts to face unsettled questions: 'We all share the same thing. We all have questions about religion, about death, about the end, about life after death … You cannot avoid the biggest question in life – the meaning of it.' He contends that posing these questions with the depth they deserve demands recourse to the most robust visual–theological grammars available in the European public square, even if those grammars are themselves also placed under question.

Despite this, the theological implications of Martin's artworks remain severely underdeveloped in the critical writing about his works. Drawing from ongoing research, including a new interview of the artist by this author, this paper will conduct a theological reading of Martin's works, focusing especially on *For Whom* (2008/12) and *Altar* (2014), arguing that they engage the decline of Christianity in the global North at the same time that they retrieve significant elements of its theology.

Amitai Mendelsohn (The Israel Museum, Jerusalem)

Behold the Man: Jesus in Jewish and Israeli art

My paper will revolve around the various appearances of the figure of Jesus in Israeli art as a significant, multifaceted and ever-present phenomenon. It is based on my PhD thesis which became the basis for a large-scale exhibition that was displayed in the Israel Museum, Jerusalem in 2016 and a book (published by the Israel Museum, Jerusalem and Magness Press, Jerusalem).

I will discuss the evolving attitudes of Jewish, Zionist pre-state, and Israeli artists towards Jesus, from the second half of the 19th century until today. For some artists, Jesus represented the victimisation of the Jew by Christian anti-Semites; some interpreted the story of his resurrection as a symbol of Jewish national rebirth. For others, the image of an outcast,

tormented Jesus battling the establishment served as a model for socio-political protest and for personal identification.

I will examine the different directions taken by Israeli artists in portraying Jesus, and show the extent to which his figure accompanied the development of Israeli art, and continues to do so to this day. From Marc Chagall to Adi Nes, the figure of Jesus is a central symbol by which subterranean currents in Jewish and Israeli self-identity can be measured and uncovered. The figure of Jesus – both alien and intensely familiar – gives voice to conflicting principles, but also serves as a point of encounter and, perhaps, reconciliation.

Asia through Exhibition Histories

Lucy Steeds, Afterall, Central Saint Martins, University of the Arts London

Michelle Wong, Asia Art Archive

Sarah Turner, Paul Mellon Centre, London

Nada Raza, Tate Research Centre: Asia

What does it mean to practise exhibition histories rather than art history? How are distinct disciplines drawn on, alongside or in contrast to art history when the focus lies on art gaining its public moment through the lens of 'Asia' (or 'East Asia', 'Southeast Asia', 'South Asia', 'Central Asia', etc.)? This session invites reflection on the methodological issues and theoretical implications of both exhibiting 'Asia' and of analysing such past shows now.

In this session, we seek to question the stationary perspective and centre/periphery binary implied by 'looking out', encouraging debate of past art exhibitions as a way to think about more mobile and contingent histories that also prompt us to look both inwards and sideways. In other words: discussion of exhibition histories that encourage looking in multiple directions.

Biljana Ciric (Independent curator and writer)

Let's Talk about Money: Shanghai First International Fax Art Exhibition

Rather small in scale and extremely modest in means, 'Let's Talk About Money: Shanghai First International Fax Art Exhibition', which ran from 15 to 25 March 1996, was an innovative and important, if little known, example of the role of artists in developing exhibition practices in China before its boom of museums, galleries and the art market in general.

With a scope (international), medium (fax paper), transmission means (fax machine) and venue (the Huashan Vocational Art School Gallery) thus chosen, a title was decided upon. 'Let's Talk About Money' was, in fact, one of the rare projects in China organised by artists to attempt to establish a dialogue among artists from both inside and outside the country.

'Let's Talk About Money' is important for having introduced a crucial paradigm for other artist-organised exhibitions, and for exhibition-making practices in China in general – that is, experimentation with exhibitionary formats and methods. The project was conceived first and foremost as something deeply embedded in its own reality and responsive to its surrounding conditions. It was precisely in this way that, through lowly means, certain values and concerns could be publicly debated, even at a certain risk. 'Let's Talk About Money' thus ushered in a new understanding of what exhibition-making could be and what it could mean to present work publicly.

In this presentation I will build on my existing work on the topic, reflecting methodologically on what it means to do art history or exhibition histories or curatorial research with respect to this show.

Lu Pan (Hong Kong Polytechnic University)

Cathay Pacific's 'Contemporary Art in Asia' Exhibitions (1965)

On 22 April 1965, Hong Kong's signature airlines Cathay Pacific launched its multiple-city touring exhibition 'Contemporary Art in Asia' in Singapore. With around 130 artworks, the show then travelled to Kuala Lumpur, Bangkok, Jesselton, Manila, Tokyo, Osaka, Fukuoka and Taipei before it finally returned to Hong Kong. It could definitely be argued that this art show was no more than a commercial promotion for Cathay Airways' flight network around Asia and may carry limited significance in art history. This paper, however, will situate the exhibition in a broader historical context, against which an intriguing picture of how the exhibitions constructed imaginations of modernity in Asia during the Cold War can be unfolded. I will explore the topic mainly from three aspects. First, how did the exhibition speak to the 'city-oriented' network of a renewed Asian alliance, which tuned down the importance of national boundaries? Second, how was the presence of Cathay's flight-hostesses (as models for press photos or even as award presenters) in the exhibitions used to feed the imagination of modernity of 'the Orient'? Finally, how can the exhibition venues, including hotel, stock trade building, commerce building, department store and museum, help us to understand the relationship between the art (market) and commercial space in 1960's Asia? After all, this 'tour of the Orient', as Cathay's own newsletter *Orient Travel* (Oct. 1965) put it, cannot escape the imperial gaze where modern cities, female beauty and architectural landmarks served as sites of cultural production for an imagined modern Asia in the capitalist camp.

Kathleen Ditzig (Nanyang Technological University, Singapore)

Constructing Southeast Asia: Soft power, alliances and the first exhibitions of Southeast Asia

Taking the first two known exhibitions of Southeast Asia, the exhibition of the 'First Southeast Asia Art Conference and Competition' in Manila in 1957 and the 'South-East Asia Cultural Festival' of 1963 in Singapore, this paper takes the title 'Constructing Southeast Asia' in order to examine the early stakes of an exhibitionary frame that is so flippantly used today to demarcate a geographical region, an emergent art market or cultural identity. The 'First Southeast Asia Art Conference and Competition' in Manila in 1957 was one of the first post-war events that sought to bring together modern and contemporary art from the region. Not only was it the first survey exhibition of Southeast Asia, but it also remarkably included the travelling exhibition 'Recent American Prints in Color', as toured through the New York Museum of Modern Art's International Program. The 'South-East Asia Cultural Festival' of 1963, on the other hand, was a national project to mark the birth of the new Federation of Malaysia and 'to propagate Singapore's position as a center of ... the emporium of South-east Asia'. Like the exhibition in Manila, it was not geographically limited to the region and included countries from the Non-Aligned Movement. Focusing on the active inclusion of 'Recent American Prints in Color' in the 'First Southeast Asia Art Conference and Competition' by the Art Association of the Philippines and the attempt to define Southeast Asia through the 'South-East Asia Cultural Festival', this paper looks to address the evolving politics of exhibiting Southeast Asia, focusing on the empowered positions of local cultural agents in mediating the Cold War cultural landscape to borrow, mould and craft distinct definitions of

Southeast Asia – the legacies of which continue to define the cultural production of Southeast Asia today.

Samina Iqbal (Lahore School of Economics)

Modern Art of Pakistan: Lahore Art Circle and the soft cultural diplomacy of the US

The first decade of Pakistan's establishment saw the emergence of a small group of young avant-garde artists called Lahore Art Circle (LAC). The group included artists: Shakir Ali, Sheikh Safdar Ali, Razzia Feroz, Syed Ali Imam, Moyene Najmi, Ahmed Parvez, Miriam Shah and Anwar Jalal Shemza. Together, these artists adapted an idiom in their paintings echoing various Western modern art movements of the 20th century. LAC provided the momentum to usher in a distinctly Pakistani modern art movement.

LAC organised five shows together in Pakistan and four of those were held at the United States Information Center (USIC) Murree between 1953 and 1958. These exhibition records show that the USIC played an important role in promoting modern art in Pakistan. What was the agenda behind this extraordinary attention of the US foreign cultural diplomacy towards LAC? Could this interest of the US be directly linked to the CIA's strategy of promoting abstract art elsewhere to combat communism through soft cultural diplomacy? Archival research at the US National Archive has uncovered a classified document suggesting just that. In this light, one must ask if LAC members were aware of it and did they deliberately use the platform of USIC to further their artistic practices?

The importance and role of USIC have not yet been researched in any depth in previous art historical scholarship of Pakistan. This paper provides a framework to contextualise the ways in which the United States cultural diplomacy directly supported and provided strategic platforms for this burgeoning group of radicals.

Diva Gujral, (University College London)

'Painters with a Camera' (1968–69): In search of the photography exhibition in India

In November 1968 (or 1969, according to some records) 'Painters with a Camera' opened at Bombay's iconic Jahangir Art Gallery. The exhibition primarily consisted of high-contrast lith negative prints made by seven teaching staff from the Faculty of Fine Arts of the Maharaja Sayajirao University at Baroda, including painters Jeram Patel and Gulammohammed Sheikh, and painter/printmaker Jyoti Bhatt. These artists sought to intervene on behalf of the medium, calling its institutional recognition at a time when the Lalit Kala Akademi and the National Gallery of Modern Art each shunned the aesthetic potential of the camera. Today, however, little documentation of the exhibition exists, except for an invitation card and a small pamphlet for visitors. There are no remaining photographs of the installation as none of the seven artists thought to bring their camera along.

I will locate 'Painters with A Camera', its objectives and eventual erasure, in a broader study of the aspirations for 'indigenism' in 20th-century Indian art. Exploring the root causes

underpinning the Baroda Faculty's own pedagogical suspicion of the camera, against which these seven photographers appear to have rebelled, I will think through the politics of the interface between art and technology in the quest for a new 'national' art. Finally, as I assess the intersections of photography, machinic modernity and modernism, I pose the practices shown in 'Painters with a Camera' as an exercise in aesthetic and temporal non-alignment.

Kerstin Winking (Independent curator and writer)

The Exhibition as Indonesian Revolutionary Weapon

How can exhibitions be used for a nationalist revolutionary cause? The exhibitions by the Indonesian artists Agus Djaya and Otto Djaya organised in the Netherlands in 1947 clearly illustrate one way. Right after World War II, on 17 August 1945, Sukarno declared Indonesia's independence, but the Dutch government refused to recognise its former colony's sovereignty. The system of apartheid that the Dutch government had implemented for more than 300 years in the archipelago was profitable, and profits were exactly what the Netherlands needed after WWII. Yet, within the Netherlands, opinions about Indonesian independence were divided. The Indonesian cause had prominent supporters such as Henk van Randwijk, chief editor of *Vrij Nederland*; WF Wertheim, professor of sociology at the University of Amsterdam; and Willem Sandberg, a resistance hero and director of the Stedelijk Museum Amsterdam. With support from Dutch local contacts, the Indonesian artists organised an exhibition of their own work that was first shown in the Stedelijk and then travelled to other prestigious locations in the Netherlands. Also in 1947, the Indisch Museum [now Tropenmuseum] showed Agus Djaya's collection, which featured works by other Indonesian painters with whom Agus had been personally acquainted since the Persagi period, including S Sudjojono, Dullah, Mochtar Apin, and Kartono Yudhokusumo. These early international exhibitions of Indonesian modern art abroad landed like bombshells in what Salam Solichin, a journalist and the biographer of Agus Djaya, has called 'psy war'.

Tina Le (University of Michigan-Ann Arbor)

Exhibiting the Ephemeral: Thinking through reconstruction and restaging in contemporary Southeast Asian art

Artist Luis 'Junyee' Yee Jr. recently joked that while artists in 1970s and 80s were obsessed with ephemerality, these same artists – in their old age – now seek forms of documentation to establish permanency or legacy for their life's work. The search for perennial artefacts or modes of display for impermanent artistic practices popular in Southeast Asia are especially true now as major exhibition efforts centred on contemporary Southeast Asian art (e.g. this year's 'Sunshower' exhibition in Japan and the forthcoming exhibition on the 1970s at the National Gallery Singapore) are positioned to redefine art and art history from the region. Some of the critical questions that need to be explored include how performances, site-based artworks, and art made from ephemeral materials are restaged, re-enacted, and reconstructed under multiple national and regional initiatives. As artists often made ephemeral works in transitory response to particular socio-political contexts, how do acts of 're-ing'

configure to international displays of Southeast Asian contemporary art now? What does one gain from the restaging of performances? What kinds of questions or set of desires might reconstructing artworks respond to in exhibition? The paper considers the exhibition lives of transient art and examines these questions through Junyee's *Wood Things* (1980) – a site-specific installation that has been reconstructed for national and international exhibition – and Jose Maceda's *Cassettes 100* (1971) – a Kaprow-cited 'happening' that has been restaged for local and international performance.

Aural Affects and Effects: Explicit and implicit sounds and rhythms in contemporary visual media

Olga Nikolaeva, University of Gothenburg

Christine Sjöberg, University of Gothenburg

Johnny Wingstedt, Dalarna University

When the body 'looks out' it does not only see, but it also perceives the visual by means of other senses than sight. Different kinds of intermedialities enhance the notion of the entanglement of the senses. Sounds in digital environments of, for instance, the internet amplify the experience of different types of imageries, while movements such as loops, short films and GIF-animations seem to create visual rhythms. In the space of, for instance, pop and rock live concerts, digital technologies are used to create advanced visual imagery, engaging aural, pictorial and embodied notions in the construction of a *gesamtkunstwerk*. Thus, in examples ranging from live concert environments to, for example, digital fashion magazines, visual imagery is merged with aural affects and effects in different ways.

This session is interested in how sound and audial resources affect the visual and how the visual creates phenomenological experiences of the aural within contemporary visual media. The questions this session seeks to evolve are: What happens to the space of the visual when explicit and implicit audial means are involved? How does the beholder's space become affected by this? How can art historical methods and methodologies be adapted to and challenged by this?

Lisa Deml (Independent scholar)

Louder Than Words. Quietude as a practice of everyday resistance

When Philando Castile was shot by police officers on 6 July 2016, his girlfriend Diamond Reynolds broadcasted the aftermath on Facebook and attracted more than 9 million viewers within the first days. This 10-minute cell-phone video became a symbol of what Castile's mother called 'a silent war against African American people'. In order to counteract the cacophony of outrage and vindication surrounding it, the artist Luke Willis Thompson created an alternative 'sister-image' dedicated to Diamond Reynolds. His intimate video *autoportrait* echoes the qualities of 1920s Hollywood silent films on black and white 35mm and seeks to restore Reynolds' right to authorship – not through volume but withdrawal of sound. Diamond Reynolds' quietude reverberates as a form of protest, an act of refusal: to speak, to produce information, to translate content into data. Through its conscious renunciation of sound, *autoportrait* challenges the audience to listen concentratedly and retrieve those voices that would soon be rendered mute. The quietness in Thompson's cinematic portrait infuses sound with impact and can be considered what Tina M Campt terms a 'quotidian practice of black resistance'. Taking Thompson's video work as a starting point, this paper views quietness as a purposeful rupture in the 21st-century media soundscape and investigates its strategic use as a practice of everyday resistance honed by those dispossessed of their own voice.

Drawing upon examples from contemporary artists such as Lawrence Abu Hamdan and Tony Chakar, I want to explore the potential of quietude as a means to making oneself heard.

Astrid von Rosen (University of Gothenburg)

Scenographing Sound in the Dance Archive: Affective atmospheres and transformative materialities

The paper explores the critical potential of an audial approach to dance archives, records and archiving in a digital age. More specifically, the paper looks into the ways in which sound forms part of scenography as a site of relational, affective and material experience in visual and multimodal records (including the body as archive) after the Swedish independent dance group Rubicon. In the 1980s, the group – led by three female choreographers – performed outdoors in public space, an activity that had a lasting impact on the local dance scene but has paradoxically not been subject to any in-depth academic research. By engaging affective atmospheres and transformative materialities the exploration highlights how audial resources create and shape dance interventions into public space. The paper leaves behind static conceptualisations of the dance archive to offer the reader clear arguments for an audial approach as a key method for critical analysis of visual and multimodal performance records.

Fiona Davies (University of Sydney, Australia)

A Bedside Medical Monitor's Song

The common medical monitor utilised at every bedside in intensive care and accident and emergency units is a commonly experienced visual phenomenon that provides a fundamental means of obtaining a perspective on the medicalised body that supplants the traditional direct observation of the body.

The monitors record a visualisation over time of data related to the patient's cardiac output, hemodynamic parameters, blood oxygenation and body temperature. This data is visualised as a screen-based construction by sign, image, text and sound. While this form of imaging would not be understood as the direct representation of a physical object, it functions as a representation of the performance of that object. A representation can be developed through data visualisation by wave forms, text and symbols, or sonification through the sound of alarms, as the data diverges from pre-set ranges defining normality.

In my practice as a visual artist I have been working for many years with the idea of medicalised death in ICU. The role of surveillance of the medicalised body in intensive care involves many practices and procedures, starting with the common medical monitor. I will examine the visualisation and sonification of the medicalised body through the relationship between an imagined body, the external imaging and sounds and the process of representation. A short extract will be played from one of my works, where the images and sounds of the monitors are re-imagined as a choral work in which a single multi-layered voice is singing the song of a patient's death.

Melissa Warak (University of Texas at El Paso)

The Clothes Make the Band: Nick Cave's 'soundsuits' and the body sonic

Textile artist Nick Cave (b 1959) has created extravagant sculptural encasings for the body that he calls 'soundsuits' since 1992. This paper uses two streams of inquiry – the engagement with bodies and the performative capacity for the soundsuits – in arguing that there are both sounds and silences implicit in the suits. Further, the soundsuits create aural tensions dependent upon bodily movement. The soundsuit is an instrument and the wearer the musician. And while much contemporary sound art employs recording and playback technologies to produce sound, Cave's techne is the body itself. But what exactly is the sonic function of the suits? It is easy to see the sonic potential in the material and composition of the suits, but hearing the suits becomes a much more complicated proposition. Museum displays of Cave's soundsuits generally include a mannequin as the armature for the suit, rendering them still and silent. However, Cave has created recent soundsuits for the purpose of performative wear and movement. In *HEARD* (2013), Cave employed pairs of dancers to inhabit the suits, which he designed for four legs and with long 'fur' made audible through movement. Cave's 'herd' of horses then danced together in New York's Grand Central Terminal. Though a choreographed work, *HEARD*'s venue in a public non-art space – a site of transit – made it seem more spontaneous; its large scale made it a spectacle. And through iPhone videos circulated online, Cave's herd inhabits a new spatio-temporal dimension: a virtual online space-time of seeing and listening.

Olga Nikolaeva (University of Gothenburg)

Visibility in Process: Visualised sound and screen imagery in Depeche Mode's performance of Angel

The paper explores sound-image relations in the performance of the song 'Angel' by the British band Depeche Mode. It investigates the potentialities of shared phenomenological qualities of sound and image, such as the ability to come to the fore or fade away, 'stream', surround and reflect within as they manifest themselves in the live performance. Sound, as a main element of any live music performance, is often deemed ungraspable and ubiquitous with its rather ephemeral qualities. It is never located in one specific place but departs from musicians and instruments to be distributed into the space of the audience by means of acoustics or amplification. Sound travels among the listeners, filling up the gaps as well as affecting and creating atmospheres and moods. However, in contemporary music performances, which extensively employ diverse techniques of visualization, sound has a possibility to be manifested by different means. Screen imagery in particular has an ability to act as an interface and make sound visible, introducing coherent relations between the aural and the visual in the temporary flow of a live music performance. With focus on Depeche Mode's performance of 'Angle', the paper looks into material and affective relation between live-streamed images of he musicians' bodies and sound in the space of the screen.

Dawna Schuld (Texas A&M University)

*Sculptural Acoustics: Colouring the Silence in Doug Wheeler's '*Synthetic Desert*'*

Though Doug Wheeler is commonly described as a 'light and space' artist, his interest in the analogous relationship of *sound* to light and space is under-examined. *PSAD Synthetic Desert III,* the 2017 realisation of a work begun in the late 1960s, brings this aspect of Wheeler's practice to the fore. In so doing, it raises questions regarding visual bias in artistic analysis and the roles of curators and historians in presenting and interpreting a work of art – and an artistic career – characterised by silence.

Because the work is experiential and iterative, it does not exist as a fixed object or as a permanent space. Its history is therefore situational and personal: it is both historical and contemporary; it is subject to revision; and its efficacy depends upon the perceptual acuity of individual visitors. Though a constitutive element of the work, its sound may be perceived but not noticed.

Following John Cage's earlier example, Wheeler had experimented with anechoic chambers, and *Synthetic Desert* is similarly soundproofed. But the work is not soundless; rather, like the de-differentiated blue haze of light – the ganzfeld – that visually characterises the space, sound is engineered, so that low tones of 'brown' and 'pink' noise produce a distinctly desert-toned 'silence.' These tones are perceived only at the fringes of conscious awareness; nevertheless, the space would be notably discomfiting without them. Their presence, then, contributes to a coherently allusive experience, one that evokes, but does not mimic, the desert environment that played a formative role in Wheeler's artistic development.

Roundtable discussion

Roundtable Discussion

Beyond Disciplinary Borders: History of science and history of art

Katy Barrett, Science Museum, London

Sachiko Kusukawa, Trinity College, Cambridge

Alexander Marr, University of Cambridge

Sietske Fransen, CRASSH, University of Cambridge

Katherine Reinhart, CRASSH, University of Cambridge

Joanna Woodall, The Courtauld Institute of Art

One of the disciplines that has benefited enormously from the work of, and working with, art historians is the history of early modern science. Indeed, one might say that looking out of the disciplinary boundary of history of science has been imperative when studying a period where 'science' and 'art' were not mutually exclusive practices or professions. For the early modern period, there has been fruitful historiographic convergence between history of art and science – a move away from 'canonical' heroes, an increased interest in the processes of making, the role of collecting and circulation of objects, and the way in which knowledge and objects travel globally.

This Round Table, chaired by Katy Barrett, Curator of Art Collections at the Science Museum, will reflect on the historical and historiographic synergy between history of science and history of art by focusing on key themes from early modern science and art: Kusukawa (observation), Reinhart (copying), Fransen (translation), Marr (epistemic images). These themes arise from the AHRC-funded research project 'Making Visible: the visual and graphic practices of the early Royal Society', a collaboration between historians of science and historians of art that seeks to understand how scientific, observational practices were closely intertwined with graphic practices. Joanna Woodall, as respondent, will lead the discussion of the value of looking beyond disciplinary borders while looking out for possible pitfalls of disciplinary differences.

Dangerous Bodies – Look out! Fashioned bodies on the boundaries

Royce Mahawatte, Central Saint Martins, London

Jacki Willson, University of Leeds

This session explores the cultural intersection between bodies, fashion and transgression. Bodies are political players in culture. What role do fashioned bodies play in resistance, in meeting governmental boundaries or institutional power? Fashion is an aspect of modern warfare. Style can defend and attack in cultural space. How do fashioned bodies occupy the grey area between social control and the resistance to power? In relation to Judith Butler and Athena Athanasiou's idea of the 'performative in the political' (2013) this session would like to consider how fashioned bodies – which are 'revolting', 'laughing', 'unruly', 'grotesque', 'contaminating', explicit, or silent and still – enact resistant strategies of protest.

The multi-disciplinary session will also consider readings of historical fashion media. How do governmental changes find embodiment in 18th-century masquerade, 19th-century fashion cultures, Modernist imagery? How does fashion intersect with race and gender discourses where colonialism, capitalism and embodiment are inextricably linked? How do acts of fashioned stillness (not passivity), play, refusal or rage mediate conflict, and challenge, critique or attack violent regimes?

Conor Lucey (University College, Dublin)

Social Transvestitism and the 18th-century Building World: The case of the 'Macaroni Bricklayer'

Among the gallery of risible modern types published in the early 1770s by engraver and print-seller Matthew Darly as Macaronies, Characters, Caricatures etc, the figure of the 'Macaroni Bricklayer' invites special consideration. Brandishing both a sword (a fashionable accoutrement of a polite gentleman's wardrobe) and a trowel (the tool of a vulgar trade), he attempts to strike a balance between usefulness and refinement. In his fine clothes and club wig he also represents an example of the contemporary anxiety with what Lawrence Klein has termed 'social transvestitism': he is literally 'wearing the 'wrong' clothing for [his] social estate'. As a key figure of the modern, commercial economy, the building tradesman was well represented in public discourse: from architectural treatises to polemical broadside and advice literature, and from commissioned portraits to satirical prints, the representation of bricklayers, plasterers and their 'sort' confirms the protean nature of 18th-century artisanal life generally.

However, while landowners and city councils appreciated the importance of builder speculators for urban improvements, criticism of the builder was legion: while some took exception to the product of his industry – the redbrick terraced house – others mocked his genteel aspirations and social mobility. Reflecting on the performative nature of dress in the Georgian era, this paper will consider how the fashionably turned-out artisan manifested

genuine concerns about the collapse of the architectural hierarchy and, by extension, the moral order of society.

Nigel Lezama (Brock University)

Nicki Minaj and Cardi B Donning and 'Dissing' Luxury's Symbolic Status

Rap and luxury fashion form hip hop's most unshakable couple. From the very beginning, Gucci and Polo were the signs adopted by rappers to express aspiration, power, and taste. As a sign, luxury fashion gains new density when brandished by young rappers like ASAP Rocky or godfather's like Jay-Z. However, female rappers appear to have a more difficult time acquiring and manipulating luxury fashion. When the female rapper demands expensive clothing from her sex partners, is she complicit in her reification as a prostitutionalised subject, or is she highlighting the value of black women's labour?

Cultural capital does, in fact, shift in meaning when male rappers don 'rollies' or Tom Ford. However, 'status' is never completely subverted – these rappers may be 'bad,' but they're still 'boujee'. Conversely, Afro-pessimist scholar Saidiya Hartman asserts that as slave, the black woman's body 'could be converted into cash, speculated and traded as a commodity, worked to death, taken, tortured, seeded, and propagated like any other crop, or murdered' (85). Her fate is not dissimilar to what she faces under the contemporary rapper-pimp's domination, i.e., in 50 Cent's 'PIMP' (2003) or in Migos' 'Bad and Boujee' (2017). Nevertheless, if we look closely at the nexus of luxury fashion, sexuality and female rappers, there occurs an important transformation of the luxury sign. Balmain, invoked in Nicki Minaj's 'Anaconda,' and 'Red bottom' shoes in Cardi B's 'Bodak Yellow' (2017) are no longer symbols of taste or habitus. Instead, these rappers question the luxury commodity and highlight what Mike Featherstone considers '[t]he glamour or magic of [luxury] goods,' in Minaj's world, or conversely, their real use value, beyond status, in Cardi B's.

Carmen Dexl (American Studies / Performance Studies, FAU Erlangen-Nuernberg)

The Intersection of Performance and Activism: The fashioned body of Josephine Baker

She is the cultural icon who popularised the banana skirt through on-stage performances that are best described as witty, provocative, and satirical: Josephine Baker. Baker who grew up in poverty in St Louis, Missouri, made it to Broadway during the Harlem Renaissance, but it was only after she had moved to Paris in the mid-1920s that she became a star.

Considering the historical and sociocultural context that informed her self-fashioning both on and off the stage, my paper will explore Josephine Baker as a style icon who not only entertained the masses but also confronted them with clichés surrounding the black female body. Presenting herself in exotic and erotic terms, Baker successfully cashed into the very sexual desires and fantasies that she sought to subvert by using strategies such as parody, comedy, and wit. Her world-famous 'banana dance' is a case in point. In line with Judith Butler's and Athena Athanasiou's claim regarding the 'performative in the political,' I will

explore selected examples of both on-stage performances and fashion photography to explicate the political impetus behind Baker's dance aesthetics and self-fashioning in oftentimes highly extravagant and daring costumes. Her critical position towards racism and sexism as well as her general stance against oppressive regimes were reflected in her work with the French Resistance during World War II and her activist endeavors to end racial segregation in the US. A look at contemporary popular culture and political movements reveals the significance of Baker's legacy to this day.

Andrea Kollnitz (Stockholm University)

Terrifying Beauty. Self-performances between art and life in Leonor Fini's oeuvre

This paper discusses the self-performative practices of the Surrealist artist Leonor Fini (1907–96). Fini may be seen as an artist who, following the ideals of the Renaissance and Mannerist artist's role, made herself and her body an expansion of her painted artworks. Through spectacular self-designed costumes, displayed in public performances and in an abundance of photographic portraits taken by some of the most prominent art and fashion photographers, Fini indulged in processes of self-transformation and liberating transgressions. She staged herself as a powerful woman artist resisting and subverting conventional gender roles and the notion of fixed identities, while simultaneously celebrating her own appearance and beauty. Interpreted through the thinking of Judith Butler, Gilles Deleuze, Erving Goffman and Michel Foucault, the case of Leonor Fini is highly relevant to a discussion of the interaction of performance and performativity in fashion and costume-related identity-construction and the negotiation of a woman artist who performs as a strong and liberate subject *through* creating herself as a perfectly accomplished object of beauty and simultaneously a terrifying powerful creature.

Apart from practices in Renaissance art, her meticulous and constant visual self-composition is clearly relatable to postmodern practices of spectacular self-fashioning and identity performance. An investigation focusing on Fini's most terrifying performances in photographic portraits, related to narratives on her scaring practices in real life, will furthermore show the important interdependency between artistic creation and self-creation, as well as creation of beauty and performances of power as two interactive and almost inseparable processes in the artist's work and life: intertwined processes that may overcome difference and power relations, not least between a created acted upon object and a creative active subject.

Francis Summers (UCA, Rochester)

Non-Norm-(Hard)Core: Hood by Air's porn archive

This paper will argue that whilst fashion has an established relation with pornography whereby erotic imagery is incorporated into a particular style, this transgression is often mediated by a non-threatening heteronormative dimension that often maintains and re-enforces gender binaries and structures of domination. In contrast to this normative porno-

chic, several fashion brands – including Hood By Air, Eckhaus Latta and JW Anderson – have used explicitly sexualised modes of representation that demonstrate a subversive direction utilising digital platforms such as Pornhub, Craigslist and Grindr to transgress fashion's established porno-chic through visceral representation and alternate modes of sociality.

Taking Hood By Air's interaction with the website Pornhub in 2016 as the key case-study, this paper will pay particular attention to the uploading of several short videos onto the pornographic website by the fashion brand. Looking at these films as both fashion images but also as found-footage films, this paper will explore how questions of appropriation, self-possession, propriety and the improper are brought up in this particular porn archive – which spans from the straight to the queer via the inhuman – observing how the limits of identity are explored. Reading this collaboration alongside Derek McCormack's short novel *The Well Dressed Wound* (2015), in which a satanic Martin Margiela interrupts a séance held by Abraham Lincoln to conduct an undead catwalk of ghouls, this paper will explore cross-categorical contamination, affective representations of embodiment, the dispossession inherent to desire, and the expansion of fashion's discursive framework beyond porno-chic into a queer un-becoming.

Rachel Dedman (Beirut, Lebanon)

Embroidery and the Intifada: Stitching Resistance in Palestine

This paper examines the role of embroidered dress in the Palestinian resistance movement of the 1970s to 1990s. It traces Palestinian embroidery's adoption as a touchstone of national heritage, following the *Nakba* of 1948, and argues for its subsequent politicisation, through PLO policy and the ubiquitous representation of embroidery by Palestinian Liberation Artists.

During the First Intifada uprising, 1987–1993, 'Intifada Dresses' were made and worn by women living in refugee camps and villages of the West Bank. At a time when Palestinian symbols were banned in public, traditional motifs mingled with doves, rifles, and signs of allegiance to political parties, were embroidered in national colours. While protest is associated with immediacy, embroidery is by its nature hand-made, private and slow. Intifada dresses, years in the making, render material the conceptual and psychological strength of the Intifada, through the labour of women. This paper argues that such dresses rendered women's bodies sites of explicit political agency on the front-line of protest, and explores the implications of this for broader readings of Palestinian embroidery in gendered terms. For men in Palestine, embroidery is licit only as political prisoners in Israeli jails; Palestinian militancy is marked, mediated and fashioned by embroidery's practice, for both genders.

Based on four years of fieldwork, research and curatorial practice for the Palestinian Museum, this research challenges nostalgic, romanticised approaches to indigenous craft, arguing for a critical understanding of Palestinian dress as political material enmeshed in a nexus of gender norms, socio-economic forces and dynamics related to labour and class.

Pamela I. Cyril-Egware (University of Port Harcourt, Nigeria)

Abadi-a-ingo*: The dress of protest in the Niger Delta Region of Nigeria*

In its role of fashioning identity, clothing has proven to be a viable medium of both socioeconomic and cultural stratification. Dress plays a fundamental role in activism by being worn in passive, violent and non-violent protest. When used in passive protest, dress can convey a powerful statement about societal events. For example, the petroleum subsidy revolt in January 2012 showed dress to be such a dynamic social force. Protesters displayed very egregious fashion that expressed the hatred and resistance each of them felt about the government's plan to remove subsidy from oil.

This paper addresses the consequence of multinationalism in the Niger Delta region of Nigeria and the ensuing protest in the face of such modernity. The multinational presence has plagued the region and its culture into a very hard situation. While modernity has tended to bring in global ideas of fashion, some young people in this area of Nigeria continue to look for a way forward. Through my own textile designs which are called *Abadi-a-ingo* – which simply means ocean-rich treasures – I have created a fabric which culturally represents the heritage and identity of the Nembe people through its design, production and cost.

I argue that the people of Nembe Se are beginning to refashion their identity through these designs. They do so through a conscious effort at donning a cultural fashion which vividly portrays the effects of bad government policy in the region, as well as the effect of multinational corporations.

Alicja Raciniewska (Adam Mickiewicz University, Poznań, Poland)

Polish 'Black Protests 2016': Political dress and the politics of fashion

On Monday 3 October 2016, hundreds of thousands of women (and men), dressed in black, joined All-Poland Women's Strike in many Polish cities to protest against a proposal for total abortion ban, prepared by conservative organisation Ordo Iuris Institute. The protest 'passed' also by Polish social media, represented by hashtag #czarnyprotest. These 'Black Protests' proved to be an effective tool for immediate political change. They are also interesting for other reasons.

Once again in Polish history, black dress became an instrument of passive resistance, an expression of rebellion and solidarity. Like many other politically engaged clothing practices in Polish history, they can be considered as an example of what Vaclav Havel calls 'the power of the powerless' and analysed as a clothing micro-strategies of the Polish protest culture. 'Black Protests' are an example of a new logic actions of social movements – decentralised, networked, using the social media. In addition, the hashtag #czarnyprotest had a huge reach because it was used by popular Polish peoples, including Polish fashion brands, designers and bloggers who made the event 'fashionable'. On the other hand, the involvement of representatives of the Polish fashion scene in the mentioned political event can be considered as politicisation of fashion and marketing strategy of social engagement/activism.

Referring to the data collected for the project Economic and Social Dimension of the Fashion Brand (NCN 51104-88), the paper discusses the issues mentioned above as examples of a more general question relating to fashion politics and the political function of clothing.

Deskilling or the Displacement of Skill: Artistic production outside of the studio

Dave Beech, Valand Academy, University of Gothenburg and Chelsea College of Art, London

Danielle Child, Manchester School of Art, Manchester Metropolitan University

This session proposes that in art deskilling did not happen. Labour history refers to the disappearance of skill with the arrival of mechanisation, automation and the technical division of labour. In art, we contend, skill did not disappear; rather, it was displaced from the artist to commercial producers, assistants, technicians and other fabricators. The contracting out of skilled work is not new to artistic practice; historically, it is visible in artisanal guilds and renaissance workshops. The literature of art during the 1960s suppressed contracting out and other dimensions of skilled labour to focus exclusively on the author. Those accounts that have acknowledged the apprentice, the journeyman, the studio assistant, the facilitator often limit themselves to the melodramatic revelation that artists since Duchamp do not make their own works, and express moral outrage that artists exploit unacknowledged assistance.

This session wishes to 'look out' beyond the author and the studio and examine the role of the unnamed journeyman or 'contractor' in the creative process. Papers are included that examine critically those modes of art-producing labour external to the figure of the artist both before the period of so-called 'deskilling' and after.

Dave Beech, Valand Academy, University of Gothenburg and Chelsea College of Art, London

Art's Division of Labour and the Discourses of Deskilling, Handicraft and Artistic Activity

The narrative of art's deskilling mimics the analysis of the transformation of the labour process under industrialisation. Commentators observe, for instance, that artists no longer display the levels of skill typical of premodern painters, sculptors, etc. This conflates the *labour process* with labour's *social form*. Also, art historians and theorists establish art's incorporation into capitalism through homologies, resemblances and associations with industrialisation. This conflates *concrete labour* with *abstract labour*. Other theories of art's deskilling are based on Harry Braverman's emphasis on the forcible transfer of control over the labour process from the skilled worker to the manager. This conflates *mechanisation and automation* with the *real subsumption of labour under capital*. This paper argues, instead, that the transition from artisan to artist must be understood in terms of art's social division of labour expressed spatially in the growing chasm between the studio and the gallery, museum, academy, art school, etc. Whereas the guild master 'was also an entrepreneur and a shopkeeper' as well as a skilled worker, teacher of apprentices and a member of the regulatory institution of the craft, the artist confronts a constellation of specialists including the professor, the paint manufacturer and the art dealer. The artist is differentiated from the artisan therefore not principally by virtue of a rejection of skill but through a specific socialisation of artistic production that needs to be studied by a separate analysis from the transition from artisan to worker.

Danielle Child, Manchester School of Art, Manchester Metropolitan University

Fabricating Value (The Invisible Hand of the Maker)

It can be argued that, since the advent of capitalism, art has never belonged to the same law of value as other commodities; in fact, it is questionable whether art can be conceived of as a commodity (in its economic interpretation) at all. Whilst productive labour was ascribed as waged labour – thus producing value and, in turn, profit – artistic labour falls under the category of (what Marx termed) unproductive labour. As such, until recently, art history has often avoided the difficult question of the economic value of art in favour of discussions centring on the philosophical, the aesthetic, the cultural and the social.

This paper reintroduces the waged labourer – the fabrication firm and its employees – to the discussion of value. It draws on the example of the American fabrication firm Lippincott Inc, established in the 1960s, which was commonly employed to provide the necessary labour to manufacture works of large-scale public art. In 1970, however, Lippincott Inc. employees were invited to make installation decisions (based on chance) for Robert Morris' 1970 *Recent Works* exhibition at the Whitney Museum. This paper thus considers the role of the waged labourer in producing works of art. How might we begin to talk about art's value when waged labour is employed to make works of art? And how is this understanding further complicated when waged labourers begin to offer (immaterial) services rather than straightforward manually-skilled work?

Kirsty Sinclair Dootson, PhD Candidate, History of Art, Yale University

Industrial Oil Paints and the Texture of Capitalism: Making colour in late Victorian Britain

By the late 19th century in Britain, the skills associated with making artists' colours (or oil paints) had almost entirely transferred from the painter to the commercial colour-maker. By this time artists rarely made their colours in the studio by hand, but instead purchased them as ready-made, mass-produced paints in tubes, which were mechanically ground and mixed by industrial manufacturers. The decline of the apprenticeship system and the rise in academic training, ensured that by 1900, painters had outsourced all the practical necessities of making colour to a commercial, industrial sector. This transferal of skill is conventionally understood in negative terms – as an evacuation of the unique meanings once imparted to colours by the painters who both made and used them.

However, I contend that it was not artists alone who were responsible for imbuing their materials with meaning. In this paper, I focus on the work of John Scott-Taylor, the scientific director of Winsor & Newton – the largest industrial colour-maker in Victorian Britain. I explore how Scott-Taylor used the texture of the paint he manufactured to voice a moral and political objection to the pernicious effects of capitalism upon art. In contrast to the homogenously smooth, greasy consistency of mechanically-ground colours, Scott-Taylor cultivated a line of especially stiff, dry, hand-ground paints. I demonstrate how Scott-Taylor's work as a commercial colour-maker was instrumental in shaping politically engaged painting in the late-

Victorian era, enabling painters to mount a critique of industrial modernity through the very materials of their art.

Roxanne Ravenhill, Victoria and Albert Museum/ Royal College of Art

'Used by all leading Architects and Builders': Contracting networks in Victorian London

According to existing accounts, 19th-century London witnessed the displacement of the master craftsman, who apprenticed and employed artisans in their own trade, in favour of the master builder, who permanently employed workers from across the various trades. By assimilating the major building divisions under one roof, the master builder was able to control quality, take advantage of economies of scale and thus erect entire buildings, competing for contracts-in-gross.

This paper considers two large-scale building firms, Colls & Sons and Trollope & Sons, to present an alternative view of Victorian contracting practices. The range of services provided by Trollope and Colls did not emerge out of the absolute integration of the labour process. Instead, both firms relied on an amalgamation of wage labour and subcontracting for the delivery of prefabricated components and trade-based work. In managing complex, multi-layered supply chains across the metropolis, this paper will demonstrate that the organisational structure of these firms were not straightforward. Rather, the success of the contractor relied on the careful negotiation of different sites of skill, as well as new techniques and technologies developed outside of the firm by art-workmen and manufacturers. Exploring these co-opted networks of construction ultimately brings into question both the dominant position of the architect as 'author' and fears over the 'loss' of technical knowledge in the production of the 19th-century built environment.

Kim Charnley, Plymouth College of Art

Ian Burn, 'Ex-conceptual' Art and the Politics of Skill

Ian Burn is credited with the first use of the term deskilling in relation to art. 'The Sixties: Crisis and Aftermath', published in 1981, argues that neo-avant-garde styles of the 1960s were deskilled: 'marked by a tendency to shift significant decision-making away from the process of production to the conception, planning, design and form of presentation'.

Derived from the work of labour theorist Harry Braverman, Burn's analysis has proved highly influential; 'deskilling' is now routinely used to explain the avant-garde's refusal of virtuosity in relation to changes in the technical division of labour under capitalism.

In what sense is art subject to deskilling? This remains a problematic question.

Burn's argument is ambiguous, but it acknowledges that skill is always required to fabricate art. His point seems to have been that artists came to *identify* with management in the 1960s: 'the physical execution [of artwork] often was not carried out by artists who could adopt instead a supervisory role'.

Benjamin Buchloh has described Burn's position as a 'rationale for the new cultural conservatism'. Buchloh maintains that art's 'deskilling' involved artists opening up to new kinds of skill, a position developed by John Roberts in his study *Intangibilities of Form*. This paper will ask why skill became a problem for pioneers of conceptual art, including Burn and other members of Art & Language, at the same time as their work became politicised in the 1970s. This perspective will be explored in order to re-evaluate narratives of art's deskilling.

Lindsay Aveilhé, Artifex Press

Lines Touching and Crossing: The role of drafter in Sol LeWitt's wall drawings

In this paper, I will be looking at the essential role of the drafter in Sol LeWitt's wall drawing oeuvre, which began in 1968 and now includes over 1,300 works. LeWitt used the assistance of local art students as early as the installation of his expansive second wall drawing (*Wall Drawing #2 Drawing Series II (A) (24 drawings)*) at Ace Gallery, Los Angeles in 1968. The following year, *Wall Drawing #3* was installed in Düsseldorf by a young artist and gallery assistant following instructions specified by LeWitt, but without the artist present. This practice continued over his lifetime with thousands of installations that have continued to accrue posthumously. Through several case examples, I will discuss the important communication channel between the artist and the assistants onsite for the execution of the works and, as a corollary, the drafter as interventionist artist. Through this lens, I will also explore the drafter's direct influence on the development and conceptual evolution of many of the wall drawings in Sol's lifetime, and the creation of the LeWitt drafter as trained professional, charged with continuing an artist's legacy still in the process of being defined.

Kuba Szreder, Academy of Fine Arts in Warsaw

Circulation and its Discontents. Project-related modes of production and new division of artistic labour

This paper analyses the division of contemporary artistic labour in the context of project-related modes of production, widely adopted in the global artistic circulation. Project-related mode of production facilitates expansion beyond gallery-studio system, overwriting traditional division of artistic labour by blurring distinctions between artists, curators, critics and support personnel, and collating skills beyond disciplinary divisions. But as cultural producers move between projects as individuals and not as project teams, artistic circulation is structured by strong competitive undercurrents. This mode of operation favours multifaceted networkers, with ability to establish and maintain connections, to create one's own brand, to capitalise on social relations and to secure opportunities. Conflicts and hierarchies specific to this arrangement are constituted not due to the division between intellectual and manual labour, nor between skilled and deskilled workforce, but rather between those who circulate (are well connected and internationally visible) and those who struggle to secure access (described by Gregory Sholette as 'artistic dark matter' [2011]). In contrast to justifications prevalent in

artistic circulation, this division is not based on merit, but rather on uneven distribution of social, cultural and economic capital, as in order to become a successful entrepreneur of him/herself (Michel Foucault 2010), one needs to have these forms of capital at his/her disposal. In this sense, the division between well and poorly connected stems from inequalities inherent to the capitalist world system and class societies.

Felicity Allen, generally post-institutional with loose affiliations

The Disoeuvre: The complexity of an oeuvre for the marginalised artist

Women, people of colour, and the marginalised, have to work socially and institutionally as well as individually in order to make work, to change existing structures so that their work might be recognised as such, and to educate institutions to help make their work, first, visible, and second, enduring. Instead of a visually consistent oeuvre, in my neologism they produce a Disoeuvre.

Some historic gallery education projects provide examples of under-recognised and contingent artistic practices, developed in Britain in a context of statutory funding for the arts during the 1980s and 1990s, and populated by (mainly) women artists, who produced projects that aimed to radicalise public sector institutions. Recognising traditions of education in emancipatory politics, an understanding that feminism is necessarily pedagogic, and the situation of art as a radical element in the conventional curriculum, artists took on curatorial roles which fed into the wider development of pedagogic artistic practices in the 2000s. Frequently, their artistic practice converged with curatorship as they produced projects employing and collaborating with others with particular skills, whether as professionals or students.

Referring to examples inside and outside the UK, for instance to Samella Lewis in 1970s LACMA or Helen Luckett at Southampton City Gallery from 1978, this paper considers how feminist structuralist approaches to art and its histories, as suggested in the early work of Griselda Pollock and Roszika Parker among others, elucidate divergent artistic practices within an artist's career which produce complex but intellectually consistent Disoeuvres.

Dialogues: Things and their collectors

Nicole Cochrane, University of Hull

Lizzie Rogers, University of Hull

Charlotte Johnson, Victoria and Albert Museum

Acts of acquiring, collecting, curating and reception of the object are generally understood as reciprocal relations between the collector and the object of desire. However, the content of that exchange or dialogue has often been taken for granted. Collecting for display and social advancement, collecting as speculation, collecting for love etc. have too often been accepted as self-explanatory, diverting academic enquiry elsewhere, and obscuring the complexities at the heart of collecting practice. This session builds on the recent development of scholarship in this field, exploring the push and pull between things and collectors, artists and institutions. It questions how dialogues between parties transform the status, values, identity and character of each. It will engage with some of the more difficult questions relating to collecting and identity, and illuminate some of the moments, movements and materials which have created, sustained and changed these dialogues.

Barbara Pezzini (University of Manchester & the National Gallery)

Prime Minister, Collector and Collectable: William Gladstone and his 'things', William Gladstone as a 'thing'

The image of Prime Minister William Gladstone was nearly ubiquitous in the mid-to-late 19th century, from paintings to cartoons and domestic items. Gladstone then enjoyed an extraordinary popularity that inspired his likeness to be reproduced in multiple media. But Gladstone was not merely the passive object of a collecting craze. He was an active collector who gathered precious objects following the cultural paradigm of the 'wunderkammer'. Gladstone also collected images of himself, both in high art and serial reproductions.

This paper explores Gladstone as collector, Gladstone as collectable, and the complex dialogue that these two categories performed within his own art collection. It first traces the activities of Gladstone as collector – Gladstone and his 'things', and how these transformed each other's status. It then reflects on the phenomenon of Gladstone as a collectable icon himself – Gladstone as a 'thing'. It finally investigates how the two modes interacted in Gladstone's collecting of his own likenesses. The paper, thus, analyses Gladstone both as subject and object of commodification, a consumer consumed. To navigate such complexity, Actor-Network-Theory, an analysis particularly attentive to the interaction of objects and humans, is utilised to delve into the conversations at the heart of Gladstone's collecting practices, to explore the push and pull between the person and the objects, and the person as object. Ultimately, the paper aims to investigate within which – intellectual and material – paradigms the dialogue between Gladstone and his 'things' originated and developed, and how collecting intersected with, and was informed by, his political career.

Sarah Wade (UCL) and **Jane Wildgoose** (King's College London & Wildgoose Memorial Library)

All That Remains: Loss, mourning and touching specimens at the Wildgoose Memorial Library

The author and collector Ivan Cenzi describes the artist Jane Wildgoose's Memorial Library as 'a place where compassion is not only tangible, it gets under your skin; a place which can only exist because of its creator's ethical concerns' (Cenzi 2016).

Our paper considers the ways in which the materials at The Wildgoose Memorial Library (WML) are in dialogue: not just with the artist/collector, but with each other, its visitors and their own histories and memories, as well as wider political, social and environmental issues.

We will discuss Wildgoose's investigation into the origins of two human skulls in the WML collection – and her responsibilities in possessing them – for a BBC radio documentary (Wildgoose, McCarthy & Whitehead 2008). We will also reflect on her research into the collection of human skulls, for the purposes of racial science in metropolitan museums, during the 19th and 20th centuries.

While many of the objects housed within the WML invoke death, loss and mourning in the context of human relationships, the collection is also home to the preserved remains of various kinds of wildlife. We consider how, within the context of the WML, these specimens may speak to wider issues of ecological fragility and environmental destruction. We also speculate on how grief and mourning might be productive affective responses to these nonhuman animal bodies (Van Dooren 2014).

Through our paper, we discuss how the WML mediates between private and public, absence and presence, humans and nonhuman animals, and, of course, life and death.

Nicole Cochrane (University of Hull)

A Beautiful Ruin: Loss and legacy in the collection of Sir John Soane

In 1833 an Act of Parliament formally acknowledged the home and collection of the British architect Sir John Soane (1753–1837) as it stood at 12, 13 and 14 Lincoln's Inn Fields, as a public museum. Soane spent most of his adult life building a substantial collection of art, sculpture, antiquities, books and models, as well as extensively remodeling the space within which to display it. Today, the museum represents one of the most unique and immersive spaces of personal curation.

Hidden within the dominant narrative of the museum is a hidden story of familial and public struggles, physical loss and an overwhelming desire to create a lasting and enduring legacy of identity and personhood. For Soane the collection was a physical manifestation of the self, of his hopes and dreams, as well as his fears for the future. It was simultaneously a piece of history and a vision of a future, juxtaposing antiquity and modernity through art and material culture. My paper explores the collection of John Soane as a document, in which the objects acted in concert with Soane himself to invoke narratives of past and present, ancient and

modern, the ruin and the ideal. This paper will (re)interrogate the narrative of the Soane bequest as an altruistic act of a benevolent collector, arguing that implicit in its collection and display was a complex and often difficult dialogue between the collector and the collected, in which both are vital participants in their modern interpretations and receptions.

Nancy Dantas (Rhodes University Grahamstown)

Inverting the question: On objects and their makers

In this paper, I wish to tip the scales of power in favour of the elided maker as opposed to the glorified collector. The modern (ethnographic) museum has traditionally privileged the collector, negating the identity, voice and agency of the (Black) individual maker, replacing it with the judicious (white European) voice of the collector and/or ethnographer, by mere virtue of the object label. By way of the label, the collector subsumes and appropriates the identity of the object, making it his own; a signifier within a chain of colonial signification. I will argue that decolonial practice entails a tipping over, a rupture with practices of provenance and description. I will be looking at a performance recently held at the South African Museum on the occasion of the dismantling of its ethnographic collection whereby these acts, deemed "criminal," were highlighted and overturned. In a so-called postcolonial world, the conversation around objects cannot be solely determined by curators and collectors. Discussions and practices of knowing must include makers, even if this means listening to ghosts and the voices of the un-dead.

Charlotte Ashby (Birkbeck)

Ceramic Dialogues: Japan, Hamburg and Copenhagen

This paper focuses on the collecting of Japanese ceramics and its instrumentalisation in the formation of new national design cultures in Denmark and Germany c1900. The collectors focused on are Justus Brinckmann, director of the Hamburg Museum of Applied Art, and Pietro Krohn, director of the Copenhagen Museum of Applied Art. Both men were part of a cosmopolitan, transnational community of collectors of Japanese art in the late 19th century. Their collecting practices meshed private passion and public duty as they sought to disseminate the values they saw in their collected objects out to a wider public of local artists, designers and consumers. Working in new national institutions with explicit nation-building agendas, their outlooks were based on an elite transnational community and the international circulation of things.

The things in question precipitated many transformations and were vessels for a series of competing ideas. They were vessels of history, memorialising the 'Old Japan' of the Edo period. At the same time, they were, in their novelty to Western audiences, vessels of modernity. The study of their design principles were key in the development of Art Nouveau as promoted by Brinckmann and Krohn through simultaneous collecting practice and support for contemporary artists. In Krohn's case, as a practising designer and artistic director of the

Bing & Grøndahl ceramics factory, we can also trace the production of new works, new things, which also joined the national collections in Copenhagen and Hamburg and sat alongside, though distinct from, the Japanese objects that inspired them.

Rachel Gotlieb (Gardiner Museum & Alfred University)

A Victorian Jug as Mutable Museum Signifier

In 1844, Charles Meigh & Son of Hanley, Staffordshire, introduced the 'Minster' Jug, a mass-produced, relief-moulded vessel, depicting crisply carved representations of the Madonna and Child and John the Baptist. By viewing it through the lenses of various actants (maker, critic, consumer, collector, and curator) across temporal and geographical space, the 'Minster's' biography and thingness change. Its networks of exchange may be explored at the Great Exhibition of 1851, within the opinions rendered in industry, public texts, and oral history The 'Minster' operated simultaneously for the middle and upper classes in Britain and the Colonies as both a decorative object and a utilitarian commodity, symbolising the power of the Christian, mercantilist British Empire, and serving as a portable, functional memento of piety and motherhood, as well as demonstrating Staffordshire's continuing manufacturing and aesthetic prowess. The sphere of actants and networks contracted in the 20th century, altering the jug's agency, from cherished family heirloom, collectable kitsch, to museum artefact inculcating the canon of decorative art history. In 2012, the Gardiner Museum in Toronto acquired its own 'Minster' through a donation from Rosemary Knox (aged 90). In September 2015, it was put on 'permanent' display as a model of the Gothic revival style. This single pitcher, therefore, tells a thousand words, used, exalted, denigrated, and catalogued, but does its thingness, seemingly enhanced in a sealed museum vitrine, diminish as its function changes from the tangible to the optical?

Sarah Coviello (Warburg Institute)

When Objects Become Connoisseurs: Herbert Horne and the attribution of the Torregiani Panels

In 1905 the caricaturist Max Beerbohm (1872–1956) sketched a humoristic drawing of his friend Herbert Horne (1864–1916), an English scholar and connoisseur based in Florence. The caricature depicted a Virgin and Child scrutinising a 'human object' in the foreground which is actually Horne himself. The caption reads: (Virgin): 'That's a *very* doubtful Horne'- (Child): 'It seems to me rather as if it might be an early Berenson' – (Virgin): 'Pooh! Nonsense! […] Everything points to its being a particularly late Loeser'.

Inspired by this vignette, my paper will shed new light on the relationship between objects and their connoisseur-collectors, arguing for a collaborative notion of connoisseurship. Horne's acquisition of a panel from the 'Torregiani' series in 1908 will demonstrate that the final attribution to Filipino Lippi and the ensuing dissection of Berenson's invented 'Amico di Sandro' were the result of a dialogue between the object and its collector. Upon entering the

collector's home the panel became Horne's closest collaborator. More specifically, it provided him with the key to understanding authorship issues by accompanying him in the transition from intuition to hard fact. Through Horne's example I will question the status of the objects as passive aesthetic possessions as presented in the existing scholarship, positing an object-centred history of connoisseurship in light of Gell's theory of agency. In doing so, I will demonstrate that in the dialogue between things and their collectors, objects too have a lot to say.

Caroline McCaffrey-Howarth (University of Leeds)

 'Sèvres-mania': Being collected by Sèvres porcelain 'ship' vases?

This paper intends to subvert the traditional notion of the histories of collecting whereby the singular and individual collector is privileged with a monographic account. Instead, it puts forward the idea that an object such as an 18th-century Sèvres 'ship' vase can act as an agent and invoke a particular response from the individual who interacts with it, taking its starting point from the anthropological writings of Alfred Gell.

Gell believes that art has the capacity to act as a social agent and thus can create certain relationships and dialogues with the viewer (or in this case the collector). With only 12 having been produced, and only 10 in existence, this paper questions how these Sèvres 'ship' vases circulated the art market and why all 10 found their way into private art collections in England in the 19th century. Writing in his *Reminiscences,* Ferdinand de Rothschild mentioned that his first ever important acquisition was a Sèvres blue ship. He adds that, due to the extravagant amount of money which he spent, he hid it in his cabinet for a couple of years before his family could question him. If we understand that the Sèvres ship had a particular kind of agency over Ferdinand which encouraged him to acquire it, despite the extortionate price, then it becomes possible to understand and consider fully the cultural phenomenon of 'Sèvres-mania', and the power which certain objects held over collectors in England in the 19th century.

Framing Space through Architecture and Film

Jessica Schouela, University of York

Hannah Paveck, King's College London

We experience architecture and film as media of duration that unfold in time. The encounter of an embodied spectator or inhabitant with a film or a dwelling is informed principally by motion and the succession of one frame or screen (architectonic and cinematic) to the next. These two modes of construction investigate the three-dimensional occupancy and representation of space as it relates to both bodies and objects, framed within curated and mediated spaces. Instantiating an experience of space that is far more than visual, architecture and film activate both sound and touch, the latter being a mutual and relational 'commitment' of the body and the world (Jennifer Barker).

How have architecture and film represented each other and in which ways do they, either similarly or distinctly, frame or design space? What happens to architecture when it is filmed and how might a building be described in terms of its cinematic qualities (Beatriz Colomina)? Moreover, how can film and architecture challenge our perceptual habits? Can film convey atmosphere of space and the built environment (Gernot Böhme)?

This session explores the mutually informing link between architecture and film in an effort not only to open up the limits of these methods of representation but also to look beyond what typically gets included within the history of art. The papers address this link through a focus on the phenomenological experience of mediated spaces, film as a method of making space, and the framing and representation of interior and urban spaces in film.

Adam O'Brien (University of Reading)

Framing: The inescapable motif?

A human figure stands at a doorway or window. Perhaps they look into the building; more likely they look outwards. Even if their face remains out of view, a sense of longing is palpable, as if the built interior is simply not enough to satisfactorily contain the human experience in this given time and place. In cinema, intratextual framing puts people in their place, but as it does so it draws attention to the forcefulness and impermanence of that 'putting'. These are often moments of heavily loaded mise en scène, in which we 'become aware of the lineaments of a social code of arrangement' (Martin 2014), as well as of the film's compositional exactitude.

This paper takes as its starting point the motif-cum-cliché of the architecturally framed body, and asks how filmmakers interested in exploring interior spaces of the built environment have creatively resisted or expanded on the 'residual meanings' of such images. It examines in detail short sequences in the work of John Cassavetes, Lucretia Martel and Hou Hsiao-Hsien – filmmakers for whom domestic space does not constitute an existential boundary. For them, architectural perimeters and thresholds are unavoidable and meaningful, but not absolute. In

an essay on film and spatiality, in dialogue with Gaston Bachelard, Vivian Sobchack writes of 'the ambiguous nature of empirically concrete happenstance' (2004), a phrase which goes some way to articulating the imaginative achievements of Cassavetes, Martel and Hou as they film bodies in (and around) buildings.

Ulrike Kuch (Bauhaus-University Weimar)

In-between Space and Time: Stairs in film and architecture

As one of the most substantial architectural elements, stairs form the transition from one level to another. Besides this very basic function, an ontological relationship with the moving body is inherent in stairs: they are 'morphantropic' – the form of steps follows the bodily conditions of the human (or animal) being.

Seen from the other side, stairs structure and define the movements of the body and therefore also the perception of the architectural space. Not just passively but also actively in being themselves a 'frozen motion', giving the space a specific characterisation of the possibility of motion. Steps act in a consecutive manner of motion–pause–motion in the same way as film images do. It is the – smooth? – sequentiality of filmic and architectural perception, that is architecturally embodied by and can be experienced with stairs.

In my paper I want to discuss the status of stairs as 'in-between' entity. What I am especially interested in is the status of stairs between time and space. This can be specified with the term 'chronotopos', as Wolfgang Kemp describes it: '[Within the chronotopos] time is condensed, it is tightened and is artistically visible; space gains intensity, it is part of the motion of time, subject and history. The features of time are now obvious in space; and space is filled by time with sense and dimension.' I will contrast this approach with the thoughts of Henri Bergson on time and space and exemplify them with examples of architecture in and outside film.

Sarah Louise Smyth (University of Southampton)

Framing Architecture in Joanna Hogg's Unrelated *(2007) and* Exhibition *(2013)*

For architectural theorist Catherine Ingraham, the asexual, or at least sexually indeterminate conceptualisation of architecture, occurs precisely through its reliance of orthogonality – its 'right-angledness'. Organised through a geometrical structure, architectural design and theory 'sterilises' the technical and mathematical economy it favours, inscribing space as sexually neutral. Yet, for Ingraham, architecture is something 'fleshy or animal'; it is inscribed with sexual and gendered implications. Using Ingraham as my starting point, this paper considers two films by British director Joanna Hogg, *Unrelated* (2007) and *Exhibition* (2013), to examine how Hogg's films problematise the 'gender-neutral' architectural line. I focus on two lines, or cluster of lines, in Hogg's films: the lines of the swimming pool as a point of architectural tension where dry meets wet, organic meets artificial, and linearity meets shapelessness; and the lines of cinematic frame where order and control are imposed over the messy, infinite and

spatially-indeterminate image. I locate my analysis within the gender tensions of these lines, both in terms of their historicised conceptualisations – masculinity as hard, dry and straight, and femininity as soft, wet and curved – and through conventional cinematic representations, specifically the swimming pool as key space of heterosexual male voyeurism and female objectification. By considering how Hogg represents – literally *frames* – swimming pools in her films, particularly with reference to her complex mature female protagonists, I argue that Hogg delineates the harshness, straightness and dryness of these lines. Complicating the gendered implications of linearity, Hogg provides a crucial intervention into the depiction of architecture in cinema.

Sander Hölsgens (University College London)

Blue Twilights and Monochromatic Architecture in Chantal Akerman's News from Home *(1977)*

Blue nights, Joan Didion writes, 'are the opposite of the dying of the brightness, but they are also its warning'. This paper explores the affective and spatial implications of New York's blue twilights, which are not the end of daylight, but rather its gloaming lining.

Specifically, I trace how twilights in New York City, as filmed by Chantal Akerman and Babette Mangolte in *News from Home* (1977), turn long, blue and deep. I propose that the film's concluding sequence renders the city's modernist architecture seemingly immune to the passing of time and an apprehension of a hurting past that tends to disappear into nothingness.

News from Home is frequently discussed as a celebration of memory, yet I would suggest it predominantly displays how (filmic) memories foreground the 'end of promise' and 'the dwindling of the days' (Didion).

By concluding with a long take, via which we slowly remove ourselves from New York's cityscape, *News from Home* seems to approximate and measure the dying of brightness. It is a poignant sequence, in which memories fade away and architecture turns monochromatic and full of veiling noise; here, the film reverberates the chilly affectivities of the onset of darkness, as announced by the ways in which the blue and bruising late afternoon covers and hides the city's vibrant and hopeful skyscrapers.

Interweaving Didion's *Blue Nights* (2012) with a close reading of *News from Home*, I argue that cinema can make achingly clear how 'time passes, but not so aggressively that anyone notices' (Didion).

Sarah Mills (Leeds School of Architecture)

'Cinematic Commons': Film architecture and an infrastructure of subtraction

'Cinematic Commons' research and practice explores alternative relationships between film, architecture and city through 'essayistic gaze', 'journeying take' and 'filmic commoning'. It

weaves together filmic techniques, an essayist approach, scenographic construct, architectural intervention and issues of public space, or 'commons', in urbanism. As film essayists such as Eshun, von Trier and Keiller demonstrated, the conscious and reflective gaze of the camera lens opens up new comprehension and imagination of urban situations and patterns of spatial engagement. From strategies of recursive narrative to manipulations of cuts and takes, the process of essayistic film-making traverses from the personal to the collective and articulates a complex range of 'commoness' in face of disparities and boundaries. The gaze and the take lay bare inter- and infra-stitial urban conditions, and manifest transient and qualitative factors of urban life from social behaviours, political actions to psychology of identity. This recognition of film as medium and instrument of architectural knowledge provides new systematic means to comprehend those Asian, African and South American cities expanding or transforming in ways beyond the rational and normative control found in European or American cities. By analysing and contrasting particular examples of film-making and architecture-making in cities such as Mumbai, Tokyo and London, for instance the work of Cinematic Architecture Tokyo and Cinema City Mumbai, our research reveals a new paradigm of the filmic construct probing new possibilities in creating cohesive and engaging public spaces. The paper exposes particular 'essayistic' narratives and how they may 'translate' to methods of making space and forms of activism.

Carolin Kirchner (University of California, Los Angeles)

The Artist-Mediated Image: Embodied experience and the vernacular cityscape in Gary Beydler's Pasadena Freeway Stills *(1974)*

A little-known figure of the Los Angeles post-war experimental film scene, Gary Beydler made only six short films between 1974 and 1976. After the failure of his last and most ambitious project, *Venice Pier* (1976), Beydler abandoned filmmaking. Although Beydler's oeuvre has thus far received little attention, his films are ripe for a (re)discovery. While all of his films engage with questions of embodied landscapes, in this paper I discuss his experimental short, *Pasadena Freeway Stills* (1974), in regard to its foregrounding of the interrelatedness of human figure and built environment. By providing a close textual analysis I argue that Beydler visualises what Vivian Sobchack has coined the 'intertwindedness' of material corporeality and the material world by inserting himself into the space. Thus, by appropriating the cityscape as part of his art, he personalises it and refigures the viewers' relationship to their urban surroundings. Furthermore, I assert that Beydler utilises the cinematic medium to create a Thirdspace, one that places the subject and object, past and present, self and other, abstract and concrete in dependent, mutually-informing relationships that speak to the condition and experience of everyday urban space.

Anna Viola Sborgi (King's College London)

London's Skyline in Architecture and Film

London's skyline is constantly evolving. Despite the double-sided attitude to high-rise living in the architectural and political debate – which produces different, often conflicting discourses in relation to tower-blocks and luxury towers – the inflow of capital into the city is materially shaped into futuristic skyscrapers, reaching up higher and higher with their vanity heights in London's sky, a gigantic canvas international architects compete to paint on. The evolution of London's vertical cityscape is mirrored by screen media in a wide variety of forms: from mainstream sci-fi movies, to television series, to artist films. Three sky-scrapers in particular – The Gherkin (Foster+Partners, 2003), n.1 Canada Square (César Pelli and Associates, 1988–1991), and the Shard (Renzo Piano Building Workshop, 2013) – have become the immediately recognisable icons of London's financial world – as opposed to more traditional symbols of London, such as Tower Bridge and the Houses of Parliament. In this paper, I will look at how, through point of view and framing, the filmic city is re-created in relation to the axis of these buildings, in a way that strategically enhances relationships of proximity and distance to them. In particular, I will look at how the relationship to other kind of spaces – the local neighbourhood, interior and exterior domestic space, in particular post-war social housing – is dynamically conveyed in film and television series, where it elicits specific social meanings, and in artist film, where it is openly deconstructed to expose the crucial role of these iconic buildings in reconfiguring London's architectural and filmic space.

Peter Sealy (University of Toronto)

Angels in No Man's Land: The Berlin Wall in film, 1945–93

Berlin's buildings frequently serve not only as representational frames but also as characters within cinematic worlds. The contested nature of spatial politics and historical memory make Berlin a fascinating case study for architecture's role in structuring fictions and for film's capacity to produce (in Aldo Rossi's phrasing) 'analogous cities.' This presentation will focus upon the spatio-political boundaries in several postwar films. In the 1950s, the state-run DEFA produced a series of *gegenwartfilms* warning East German audiences of the corrupting lure of capitalist West Berlin. Films such as Gerhard Klein and Wolfgang Kohlhaase's *Berlin, Schönhauser Corner* (1957) helped to build the ideological case for the construction of the Berlin Wall in 1961. However, this division made them not only unnecessary but also impossible, for the DEFA's cameras could no longer use the bright lights of the Ku-Damm and the totemic ruin of the Kaiser Wilhelm Memorial Church as illustrations of the Medusa-like dangers of the west. The angels in Wim Wenders's *Wings of Desire* (1987) are confined to the real setting of West Berlin and an imagined border zone inside the multi-layered wall. By the time of the 1993 sequel *Faraway, So Close*, the wall has fallen and both the angels and Wenders' camera could now wander eastward. Using the on-location camera's movement as a surrogate for the mobility of the viewing subject, this presentation will analyse Berlin's spatial configurations through the cinematic representations of the Berlin Wall.

Global Perspectives on Surrealism

Krzysztof Fijalkowski, Norwich University of the Arts

Matthew Gale, Tate

Jennifer Mundy, Tate Gallery

Gavin Parkinson, The Courtauld Institute of Art

One of the most revolutionary and popular cultural movements of the 20th century, surrealism was inherently international in its scope and ambitions but its global impact has yet to be fully identified or evaluated. Originating in Paris, home to artists, writers and intellectuals from many countries, the movement vehemently rejected colonialism and nationalism ('we are disgusted by the idea of belonging to a country at all'). Personal communications and journeys, the staging of international exhibitions, and the dissemination of books and magazines helped spread surrealism's beliefs and practices. But how was the movement perceived in other countries? What were the elements in its politics, philosophy, literature and art that individuals in other cultures found resonant or problematic? And in the post-war years, when surrealism was discounted as outdated by many, where and with what aspirations did it continue to flourish or influence artistic production?

In examining how surrealism was viewed beyond Western Europe and North America, this session aims to look outside the usual geographies and interwar histories to gain a clearer understanding of the movement's global presence and enable a more complex and critical understanding of its transnational appeal from the 1920s to the 1960s. It aims to bring to light the political and cultural particularities of how surrealism was perceived and sometimes reframed in countries as diverse as Chile, China, Japan, Romania, Sweden and Turkey. In so doing, the session asks how our current understanding of surrealism's identity, significance and legacy is changed by these global perspectives.

Lauren Walden (Coventry University)

Surrealism in China: The case of Lang Jingshan

China is a country not normally associated with surrealism, overshadowed in this regard by its neighbour Japan, but there were significant links. In 1925, André Breton wrote of plans to visit China in describing a dream in 'Lettre aux voyants' and, though he never travelled to Asia, surrealism proved influential among avant-garde circles in cosmopolitan Shanghai, a city that had a unique status in China as an international treaty port with a French concession. In the interwar years several Chinese art students visited Paris and Lyon to study western art. Among these, the painter Sanyu hired surrealist muse Kiki of Montparnasse to sit for him in 1930 and Pang Xunqin painted a surrealist-inspired pastiche called *Suchlike Paris* in the following year. In Shanghai, the Storm Society (*juelanshe*) cited 'the dreamscapes of surrealism' approvingly in its manifesto of 1932. Three years later the journal *Art Winds* (Yifeng) published a special edition on surrealism that included a translation of Breton's 1924 manifesto. This was translated by Zhao Shou, an artist who had studied in Japan, another conduit of surrealism into China, and who said his aim was to paint a 'non-realistic reality'. After discussing how surrealism came to be known and how it was understood in China in the interwar years, I will look at the early photographic work of Lang Jingshan, who lived in Shanghai until the advent of the Sino-Japanese war in 1937. I make a case for seeing Lang Jingshan as working in a surrealist vein by comparing his daring treatment of nudes – he was the first Chinese photographer to portray female nudes – to photographs by Man Ray, whom he was to meet in Paris after the Second World War, and by examining his 'composite photographs'. Lang Jinshan, however, was well versed in

avant-garde practice, and I also will look at his interest in western pictorialism, as practised and promoted by the photographer Alfred Steiglitz in his 291 Gallery in New York, noting that Jingshan's archives reveal reproductions of photographs by pictorialists such as Steiglitz and Imogen Cunningham, alongside works by Man Ray.

Emil Leth Meilvang (University of Oslo)

The Glow of the Whole: Mapping Scandinavian Surrealism

In January 1935, the first international surrealist exhibition took place at Den Frie Udstillingsbygning in Copenhagen. The exhibition – organised by Vilhelm Bjerke-Petersen and Egon Östlund – presented a range of surrealist works by artists from Scandinavia next to an extensive selection of works by artists associated with the Paris group chosen by André Breton, Max Ernst and Erik Olson. Taking its cue from this exhibition, this paper traces the mutual influences between the Parisian circle and its pan-Scandinavian counterparts, and suggests the importance of recognising these exchanges and contributions. Revolving around the two magazines *Konkretion* and *Linien*, and spurred on by artists' visits to Paris, the vibrant surrealist hub in Scandinavia was self-consciously international in its scope. Looking at Vilhelm Bjerke-Petersen and his influential book *Surrealisme* (1934), I show how this artist distributed, re-articulated, expanded, and negotiated surrealist ideas, and how he did not simply echo a French style but rather developed a distinctive and specific variant of Bretonian theory, creating something close to a particular Scandinavian model of surrealism. This paper thus maps out the ties between Copenhagen and Paris, and fleshes out a certain aspect of what Breton in his catalogue essay to the 1935 exhibition called the movement's 'entire glow', meaning its internationalism.

Karolina Koczynska (University of Edinburgh, Edinburgh College of Art)

The Myths of Surrealism in Interwar Poland: The case of Artes

Referring to the interwar Polish avant-garde, the artist Tadeusz Kantor remarked after the Second World War that 'there was no surrealism, because Poland was ruled by Catholicism'. Art historian Piotr Piotrowski echoed this view when he suggested that the 'prudish Polish public' would have been outraged by the movement. But these assessments are wide of the mark because they take a narrow view both of surrealism and of art production in Poland. This paper will discuss artes, a multi-ethnic, historically marginalised group of artists working in interwar Lwów, who engaged with surrealism. Informed by the socio-political situation of Lwów, artes's iteration of surrealism intertwined with local cultural producers, including the writer Bruno Schulz and philosopher Debora Vogel. I will demonstrate how their artistic praxis can be understood in terms of Schulz's notion of the 'mythologising of reality' and as a locally grounded reinterpretation of myth, folklore, and the occult that aimed to confront the increasing nationalistic and authoritarian government of Poland. This paper thus points to the complexities surrounding the identification of artes works as surrealist, issues that also arise in relation to surrealist groupings in other countries and contexts.

Will Atkin (Courtauld Institute of Art, University of London)

Demonic Surrealism in Bucharest: Gherasim Luca and the Black-Magical Object

In the midst of the near-total meltdown of Romanian society during the Second World War, a new branch of the international surrealist movement sprung up in Bucharest. The clandestine wartime activities of this group would attempt to reframe surrealism while hermetically sealed off from the rest

of the world by domestic unrest and world war. At odds with the vision of surrealism set out by André Breton in Paris during the 1930s, the Romanian surrealists conceived of their activities in nihilistic and radical terms. For them, surrealism was a vessel for a relentless rerouting of the status quo: in their treatise *Dialectics of the Dialectic* (1945) Gherasim Luca and Dolfi Trost described it as existing in 'continual opposition to the whole world and to itself'. After situating the development of surrealism in Bucharest, this paper will show how Luca applied this nihilistic discourse in his 'demonic' objects of the early 1940s, which built on the surrealist movement's interests in the Gothic, in magic and in objective chance, and ultimately reorientated them. For Luca surrealism was a mode of response to the crises of the mid-20th century, one that was all the more valuable because malleable and open to reinterpretation.

Katia Sowels (École Normale Supérieure, Paris)

Chile: An example of conquest by the Surrealist 0bject 1941–48

In 1948 the poets Braulio Arenas and Jorge Cáceres exhibited a mannequin decorated with verses from André Breton's poem 'L'Union libre' at the Dédalo Gallery in Santiago. This life-size *poem-object* was less a tribute by the Chileans to the French poet than the proof of an alliance and a vision of the world shared through the prism of surrealism. In this paper I will explore the adoption of surrealism in post-war Chile, and the mechanisms through which individuals identified themselves as surrealist, focusing on the creation of surrealist objects by Chilean poets and artists between 1941 and 1948. Arenas was involved in the establishment in 1938 of a Chilean surrealist group called La Mandrágora (The Mandrake) that published a journal of the same name. The group established contact with André Breton and Benjamin Péret in 1942, and Arenas formally proclaimed the group's allegiance to the broader movement a year later. The artists' and poets' surrealist objects featured in *Leitmotif*, a second magazine associated with the group, and were included in group exhibitions in Santiago in 1941, 1943 and 1948. I will discuss these objects in relation to those produced by the Parisian group, and, more broadly, will look at how surrealist values and ideas were introduced to Chile, using the correspondence of Arenas and Cáceres with Breton.

Ambra D'Antone (Courtauld Institute of Art/Tate Modern)

Yüksel Arslan's Surrealism and Turkish Iconography

This paper focuses on Yüksel Arslan's depiction of hands, a recurrent feature in his oeuvre, suggesting instruments of institutional power, puppet theatre and fetishised symbols of eroticism. This imagery, I argue, functioned as a negotiating tool between French surrealism and Anatolian iconography. Born in Istanbul in 1933, Arslan was invited to participate in the 1959 EROS exhibition after Edouard Roditi introduced his work to André Breton, but the Turkish government did not allow his works to leave the country. In 1961, Arslan moved to Paris, where he lived and worked until his death in 2017. Arslan was undoubtedly influenced by surrealism, and exhibited alongside surrealist artists in numerous occasions, including the 1964 *Le Surréalisme: Sources – Histoire – Affinités* show at the Galerie Charpentier. His art production, however, was idiosyncratic and reflected his thoughts about the material and intellectual processes behind art-making. Analysing selected works, this paper will suggest that the hands in his imagery symbolise a marriage of surrealist ideas with Turkish politics, Ottoman shadow theatre and Islamic mysticism. Embracing both Eastern and Western practices while not fully partaking in either, Arslan's art reveals an appropriation and reframing of surrealist thought in the context of a personal diaspora.

Jelena Stojković (Arts University Bournemouth)

The Surreal Condition of Surrealism in Post-war Japan

Opening an introductory text in the special volume dedicated to surrealism in the December 1970 issue of the leading Japanese art magazine *Bijutsu techō*, Iwaya Kunio, who had just translated Patrick Waldeberg's *Surrealism* (1962), quoted a comment made by Maurice Blanchot in 'Reflections on Surrealism' (1945) saying how no-one belongs to this movement any more but everyone feels they could have been part of it. For Blanchot, as well as for Iwaya, surrealism had become ubiquitous, largely as a state of mind. Both were thinking about the situation in France but the comment also resonates powerfully with Japanese post-war art: surrealism was deeply embedded in much of the post-war Japanese avant-garde art but its presence was generally unacknowledged. This paper discusses some of the ways through which surrealism informed post-war art in Japan, looking at the curatorial work of the major surrealist poet and translator Takiguchi Shūzō, the influence of such artistic collectives as the Democrat Artists' Association (Demokurāto bijutsuka kyōkai), and the generation of surrealist writers, including, for example, Shibusawa Tatsuhiko, who worked independently but were in contact with surrealism's international orbit. The paper also examines the relevance of surrealism to post-war photography, among such practitioners as Ōtsuji Kiyoji.

Elizaveta Butakova-Kilgarriff (Independent scholar)

After Magritte: Victor Pivovarov's 'cerebral' surrealism

In the 1960s and 1970s, pseudo-surrealist art in Russia proliferated as a derivative mode that within the post-war Soviet context expressed a dissident position. It can be seen in the work of numerous 'unofficial' artists (Ulo Sooster, Vladimir Yankilevsky and others), often combined with influences from Russian folk traditions and children's stories. In his book *The Experimental Group* (2010) about Ilya Kabakov and the context of 'unofficial' art, Matthew Jesse Jackson pointed to the tendency within unofficial art 'to equate modernism with surrealist experiment', leading to a clash of styles in which avant-garde abstraction was often eclipsed by what was perceived as the more 'authentic' (and in Russia forbidden and lesser known) legacy of the surrealists. Subsequent Western reception of this work, however, was unenthusiastic, dismissing it as unimportant or 'bad' art. While many of these works related to the body and sought to transgress taboos, the work of painter and illustrator Victor Pivovarov (born 1937) showed a response to the legacy of de Chirico and Magritte in his use of a flat, illustrative style. He claimed to be interested only in the 'form' or style of those who influenced him, among whom was the Russian pioneer of abstraction Malevich, rather than their ideas or values. Focusing on Pivovarov's works of the 1960s and 1970s, this paper will map the history of Russian engagement with surrealism both as a political and an artistic force. It will analyse how and why Magritte's use of words and images of frames within his paintings chimed with the concerns of Pivovarov and Moscow conceptualists in this period.

Roundtable discussion

Interdisciplinary Entanglements: Towards a 'visual medical humanities'

Fiona Johnstone, Middlesex University

Natasha Ruiz-Gómez, University of Essex

Visual culture (including art history, fine art, and museum studies) is currently a marginal discipline within the medical humanities. This may be changing, with the recent integration of arts methodologies into medical education, and a renewed interest in the efficacy of the arts as therapeutic tool. However, these developments have arguably served to instrumentalise the visual arts, and have failed to recognise that visual scholarship and practice has a vital role to play in the construction of knowledge (as opposed to simply the dissemination of it).

We believe that practitioners of art history and visual culture have yet to convincingly articulate the contribution their discipline can make to this field. To address this, participants in this roundtable discussion will be invited to imagine the possibility of a 'visual medical humanities' as an arena for productive critical engagement. Acknowledging that 'the space where one speaks' and 'the space where one looks' operate according to different sets of rules (Foucault, 1970), a 'visual medical humanities' might advocate for an increased sensitivity to the potential of the visible (and invisible) to articulate that which may not be expressed in words.

Given the necessarily interdisciplinary nature of the medical humanities, participants will consider how we might use the tensions between disciplines constructively, and how the 'messiness' of interdisciplinarity might offer a valuable space for critical collaboration and productive entanglement.

Roundtable participants:

Suzannah Biernoff (Birkbeck, University of London)

Ed Juler (Newcastle University)

Natasha McEnroe (Keeper of Medicine, Science Museum)

Zoë Mendelson (Wimbledon College of Arts, UAL)

James Peto (Head of Programme, Wellcome Collection)

Susan Sidlauskas (Rutgers University)

Just Looking? Art, pedagogy & the object lesson in the long 19th century

Elena Chestnova, Università della Svizzera Italiana

Andrea Korda, University of Alberta

The popularity of object lessons in the 19th century attests to the fact that looking at things was not taken for granted as a straightforward or innate activity. Vision was to be educated. Its formation was embedded in a complex of senses and 'mental faculties', which meant that seeing involved more than just the eye; it was both multi-sensorial and multi-dimensional. Looking was not always aimed solely outwards, and the path between the subject and the object was not necessarily a direct line.

This session examines the history of the object lesson – a pedagogical approach that relies on first-hand engagement with artefacts and phenomena – by including contributions that investigate its 'messy' instances. The growth of both general and artistic education in the 19th century saw the methodology of learning through things expand into new media, with images increasingly used as learning aids. Teaching activities of artists and historians led to the introduction of object lessons into artistic practices and art historical writing, and in some instances, artworks themselves became object lessons. How can we understand 19th-century object lessons in view of this growing complexity? And what are the implications for our conceptualisation of vision, which indeed 'has a history'?

Sarah Anne Carter (The Chipstone Foundation and University of Wisconsin-Madison)

Picture Lessons: Object teaching and 19th-century visual culture

Louis Prang's *Aids for Object Teaching: Lithographer* is a familiar document in the history of printing. It's a clever image: a chromolithograph that depicts four skilled tradesmen hard at work creating a lithograph. Using a once popular form of pedagogy called 'object lessons', 19th-century children were taught to see this lithograph as the subject of its own lesson, as a material document in the art of creating planographic prints. My research reveals that objects like this print offered school children unexpected lessons in moral training, in constructions of race, and on the possibilities of citizenship. As object and as image, Prang's 'Lithographer' was used to help children see the ways both morality and labour could be crystallised into a material thing.

My paper examines two groups of classroom teaching aids, from the 1840s through the 1870s, to consider the specific lessons pedagogues aimed to teach children through the study of visual culture. My project reinserts these lithographs into the lesson plans created for them to define a viewing culture that developed through object-lesson pedagogy. In it, serialisation, comparison, causation, and implication are central to the meaning of seemingly static, singular images. By applying these techniques to pictures not explicitly created for the classroom, like genre paintings, my work offers a new way to understand mid-19th-century American visual culture.

Lucy Hartley (University of Michigan-Ann Arbor)

'Pictures for the People', or, lessons in art and life

On 14 April 1881, Canon Samuel and Henrietta Barnett opened the Whitechapel Fine Art Loan Exhibition in St Jude's School.

Inspired by John Ruskin's teachings on art, the Barnetts would open the doors of St Jude's every Easter holiday, including on Sundays, for the next 17 years. This paper offers an account of the ways in which the annual art exhibition was intended to present a moral and cultural palliative for poverty. Drawing on catalogues and first-hand reports from the early years of the Exhibition, I shall reconstruct the pedagogic principles that motivated the Barnetts to present 'pictures for the people' in a locale infamously described as 'outcast London'. How were artworks, primarily paintings by contemporary artists, used to teach the poor? Upon what basis were pictures selected for display? What kind of knowledge was disseminated from the pictures, and by whom? And which pictures proved the most popular, and why? Through analysis of the objects and individuals that converged and collided in the spaces of the Exhibition, I shall explore the possibility of re-shaping the lives of the poor via engagement with images, and the problems arising from the translation of art from privilege to pedagogy.

Shana Cooperstein, McGill University

Drawing Lines, Contracting Visual Habits: Félix Ravaisson and learning to see 'à coup d'oeil'

My paper examines mid-19th-century French art pedagogy in relation to various concepts of habit and habit formation (also known as procedural and muscle memory). I argue that opposition to habit is 1) a retrospective art historical conceit that has prevented contemporary scholars from understanding its importance to 19th-century art pedagogy and that 2) habit was fundamental to the philosophical tensions at play in art education itself during the 19th century. Commonly considered an obstruction to free thought and creativity, numerous philosophers, art critics, historians and artists over the past 300 years understood habit as anathema to artistic production. As a result, many art historical studies have argued that 19th-century artists eluded artistic training to undermine the well-worn habits or the routine advocated by the Academy. Such approaches disregard the influential ideas of many prominent art pedagogues who did not find habit and creativity incompatible.

As an example of this, I look to the work of philosopher and archaeologist Félix Ravaisson, investigating how Ravaisson's drawing regime placed importance on cultivating ocular habits, namely à coup d'oeil – a glance that takes in a comprehensive view. By analysing the system conceived by Ravaisson, I explore how and why pedagogues placed such an importance on cultivating particular habits of seeing and thinking through art instruction. I argue that the emphasis on establishing modes of seeing and thinking had a significance that went beyond pedagogy: it suggested a particular way of conceiving the self, subjectivity, vision, and humanity in a rapidly modernising France.

Tamar Kharatishvili (Northwestern University)

Learning How to See: Photographs of Karl Blossfeldt and Edward Weston

This paper takes as its point of departure the landmark exhibition 'Film und Foto', which opened in Stuttgart in 1929. 'Film und Foto' staked a place for the autonomous, truth-telling capacity of the camera lens, in keeping with the objectives of New Vision, or Neue Sachlichkeit, photography. Represented at this exhibition were photographs of organic plant matter, created by Karl Blossfeldt and Edward Weston. I explore the various and divergent discursive fields occupied by the work of these two photographers, belied by their simultaneous inclusion in 'Film und Foto'. I consider their respective strategies of composition and 'staging' of the photographs, and interrogate the issue of authorial intention. I argue for a close relationship between modernist photography and 19th-century practices of visual learning, and contend that the photographs of Blossfeldt, and that of Weston to a certain degree, must be considered as descended from pedagogies of viewership and the 19th-century object lesson. I show that Blossfeldt's heavily retouched images – created as didactic aids for his sculpting and modelling classes at the Royal Museum of Arts and Crafts in Berlin – demand a different visual practice than do Weston's photographs, which in their framing and composition staked out their status as 'fine art'.

Rosie Spooner (University of Glasgow and Glasgow School of Art)

Showing and Telling: Object lessons at international world's fairs

During the 19th century, learning through first-hand engagement with things was taken up by educators across a range of disciplines. As this session notes, the methodology of the object lesson moved beyond the study of artefacts and specimens and came to encompass a wider variety of sources. It can be argued that a diversification in sites of learning paralleled this expansion of media. No longer restricted to classrooms and lecture theatres, the object lesson permeated other settings. The paper proposed here takes up both of these concerns, exploring this pedagogical strategy in the context of international world's fairs. The philosophy of the object lesson was at the core of this event structure. The paradigm was based on an epistemology that linked seeing and knowing, meaning it was predicated on a technology of vision that underlined the act of observation. By fusing education and entertainment, study and spectacle, international world's fairs offered the public an immersive cultural experience that emphasised the primacy of the eye. While material objects were the stated focus of these events – industrial machinery, household appliances, furniture, paintings, minerals, clothing and foodstuffs comprised the majority of displays – what might be termed animate objects similarly attracted considerable attention. Female shop attendants and waitresses, musicians and performers from the Indian subcontinent, so-called 'native villages' that housed colonised peoples, and crowds of exhibition-goers were conceived as things that could yield new knowledge and insight through studious observation. At international world's fairs people were also the subjects of object lessons.

Jason Vartikar (Stanford University)

Stanford's Colossal Museum and Transportive Objects in the Stanford Family Collection

When Leland Stanford Junior died in 1884 at age 15, he was already a perspicacious collector of objects with the power to summon history: not only stained ancient Greek vessels, but rare taxidermy and militaria, such as horsehair from Napoleon's carriage. Junior even staged his collection in the attic of his family's hilltop mansion, imagining it as his personal 'Residence Museum'. After Junior's death, his mother Jane founded the Leland Stanford Junior University and Museum in his memory. The museum she built was a 100,000-square-foot hewn-limestone colossus, exhibiting 10,000 objects purchased from the Metropolitan Museum of Art, along with other art and artefacts, including Junior's original personal collection preserved under glass. Opening in 1894, the museum was the largest university museum in America before an earthquake reduced 80 percent to rubble.

This paper represents a fundamentally new account of the Leland Stanford Junior Museum, discussing its pre-earthquake collection as a case study for the role that objects played in university pedagogy in the decades before the fin-de-siècle. Drawing from Junior's original personal collection, his private papers and letters, and the University Archives, the paper examines how the imagination of the young boy – who envisioned his historical objects as portholes to the past – became a foundational philosophy for the museum built in his memory. Within its gigantic halls, even tiny objects were staged as history-summoning actors for the museum's visitors and students – like a 3-inch, bullet-grazed battle flag fragment from the American Civil War, the very first object in Junior's collection.

Nickolas Lambrianou (Birkbeck College, University of London)

Matter in the Wrong Place: The object lessons of the granite bowl

Berlin's monumental granite bowl, commissioned by Karl Friedrich Schinkel in the 1820s as a modern complement to the collection of antiquities which were to be housed in his Altes Museum in the Lustgarten, never made it to its destination in the rotunda. Intended as a demonstration of Prussian technological mastery, the largest single piece of granite to be uprooted and transported across the Prussian landscape eventually had to be left outside the museum. It stands there to this day as an object lesson to art and institutional history alike. An ambiguous cultural object – neither monument nor sculpture in the traditional sense – the 40 billion year old piece of granite evidences a fascination with nature and materiality that permeated the post-Kantian intellectual landscape. Goethe in particular – who wrote about the very boulder that the bowl was created from – utilises the inorganic object to reflect on the spatialisation of time and the temporalisation of nature. At the same time, the bowl is a visual reminder of the aesthetics of the Biedermeier period: uncannily domestic (despite its scale), tasteful, balanced, proportionate. What connections might this object help us make between the private and the public – the institutional and the domestic – taste of a period? And what lessons were drawn (and are still to be drawn) from the cultural obsession with the inorganic and the prehistoric that this object embodies?

Medieval Eurabia: Religious Crosspollinations in Architecture, Art and Material Culture during the High and Late Middle Ages (1000–1600)

Sami Luigi de Giosa, Oxford University

Nikolaos Vryzidis, Independent Scholar

The coexistence of Christianity and Islam in the Medieval Mediterranean led to a transfer of knowledge in architecture and material culture which went well beyond religious and geographical boundaries. The use of Islamic objects in Christian contexts, the conversion of churches into mosques and the mobility of craftsmen are only some manifestations of this process. Although studies beginning with Avinoam Shalem's *Islam Christianized* (1996), have dealt extensively with Islamic influence in the West and European influence in the Islamic Mediterranean, sacred objects, and material culture more generally, have been relatively neglected. From crosses found in Mosques, to European-Christian coins with pseudo/-*shahada* inscriptions, medieval material culture is rife with visual evidence of the two faiths co-existing in both individual objects and monuments.

This session will endeavour to address these issues with papers touching upon various aspects of material culture and art (from textiles to precious oils, and from manuscripts to rock crystals), and covering most of the Mediterranean geography (from Spain to Sicily, and from Egypt to Byzantium and the Ottoman Empire). Finally, the contexts within which these interactions are negotiated reveal how multi-layered the religious arena can be, going well beyond the dynamic of exoticism and even otherness: from shared material culture and church interiors, to the visual landscape of Christian-Muslim literati and luxurious artefacts laid to rest in tombs.

Maeve O'Donnell-Morales (The Courtauld Institute of Art)

Islamic Objects on Castilian Altars: Luxurious building blocks for a new identity

By the time the Castilian king, Fernando III, conquered Seville in 1284, 500 years had elapsed since the introduction of silk production techniques onto the Peninsula by Muslims. By the 13th century, Islamic-style textiles produced by northern-Castilian and Italian workshops had become popular commodities on the Peninsula and across Europe. The repeated representation of textiles with Eastern patterns and Arabic inscriptions on the altars of the *Cantigas* manuscripts (c1280), for instance, alludes to the ubiquity of such fabrics in church interiors. In addition, ecclesiastical inventories repeatedly record the juxtaposition of Islamic and Islamic-style objects – from textiles to rock crystal and metalwork – with Christian objects and images on the altar.

The display of 'Islamic' materials in Christian contexts has been often interpreted as either an expression of the peaceful co-existence of these two communities in the face of Christian territorial expansion into Andalusian towns and cities or as evidence of heated cultural polemics. Both theories play down, however, the complex role of lay tastes and commerce on the appearance of the Castilian altar. This paper will explore Castilian perspectives on 'Islamic' objects on Christian altars during the 13th and 14th centuries through an investigation of their production, circulation and commercial value. By reconstructing the

appearance and role of 'Islamic' materials on Christian altars, I will attempt to show how these should not be read simply as signs of polemics nor markers of passive reception but as integral building blocks of an increasingly complex material culture.

Francesco Lovino (Center for Early Medieval Studies, Brno)

Arabs, Christians and the Gospel Marc. gr. Z. 539.

Twelfth-century Palermo was a city animated by different languages, cultures and religions, as is well described by the famous miniature in the *Liber ad honorem Augusti*, which depicts the city in mourning after the death of William II. The Hauteville rulers, especially King Roger II, promoted a cultural programme reflecting this Mediterranean koiné. The rhetorical choice of using Arabic artists to create the image of a luxurious and cosmopolitan court, while Byzantine art emphasised Roger's role as *pius rex christianus*, sustained and legitimated his political aspirations and power. In this context, it is not surprising the realisation of a Greek-Arab Gospel, the Marc. gr. Z. 539, today preserved at the Biblioteca Nazionale Marciana of Venice. Executed by a Greek and a North African scribe working at the same time, as suggested by the same black and red inks used along the text, and illuminated with elegant Blütenblatt decoration that recalls the best solution adopted by the Kokkinobaphos' atelier, the codex embodied the cultural dynamism of Norman Sicily, where Latins, Greeks and Arabs lived together. The purpose of the paper is to investigate the milieu in which the Marc. gr. Z. 539 was made, its relationship with the coeval artistic production in Sicily and in the Byzantine Empire, and especially its role among the Arab and Christian groups cohabiting together in the *urbs felix* during the 12th century.

Vera-Simone Schulz (Kunsthistorisches Institut in Florenz)

Beyond the Church Treasury: Laying Islamic artefacts to rest in Medieval Europe: The geopoetics of graves and gravestones

The presence of Islamic artefacts in medieval Europe has been very much in the focus of scholarly attention, particularly since Avinoam Shalem's monograph 'Islam Christianised: Islamic Portable Objects in the Medieval Church Treasuries of the Latin West' (1996). The term 'circulation' (of artefacts) has equally played a crucial role in scholarly discourses in this regard. This paper seeks to explore transcultural interactions between the Islamic and the Christian world by means of portable artefacts beyond church treasuries, and it seeks to grasp the role of artefacts put out of circulation (and often even out of sight). By means of case studies, this paper will shed new light on the role of Islamic artefacts in medieval European burial practices. It will focus on specific artefacts and their materiality as well as on the particular role of Arabic script in this context. Analysing both the evidence of actual graves with Islamic artefacts in medieval Europe and graves represented in late-medieval European painting, equally featuring Islamic elements, this paper will discuss the 'geopoetics' of medieval European funerary practices, when not only human beings, but also (far travelled) objects were laid to rest.

Hani Hamza (Independent scholar)

Balsam Oil: Mamluk contribution to Medieval Christian liturgy

The exchange between Islam and Christianity in the Levant was not limited to the fields of material culture, but extended to symbolic religious objects. The Mamluk sultanate in Egypt (1250–1517) was ruled by an oligarchy of slave-soldiers of non-Moslem origins who converted to Islam. They are best known for their fanaticism, as new converts who gained legitimacy by defending Islam against its mainly Christian enemies. It is a wonder how a state with such a strongly anti-Christian ideology promoted a product for use in Christian liturgy: the balsam oil.

The oil exuded from the Balsam tree is the aromatic resinous juice of *Balsamodendron Opobalsamum*, now commonly known as balm of Gilead. In medieval times, in addition to its medicinal uses, Christians used it as sacramental oil for anointing, especially in baptism, chrismation, confirmation, and ordination in the Coptic, Greek, and Roman churches. Mamluk Egypt was the exclusive source of this oil in the Middle Ages and the authorities promoted its production and monopolised its trade with Christian churches and as diplomatic gifts to Christian rulers. The oil was worth its weight in gold until the mysterious end of its production at the end of the 15th century.

The paper will show how balsam oil, or balm, attained its sacred attributes through traditions related to the journey of the Holy Family in Egypt and their stay in Maṭṭarīyya near Cairo, in whose gardens the balsam plant was exclusively cultivated. It will also show when it was planted and how the oil was produced and refined, based on Mamluk narratives.

Other sources used are the accounts of medieval European travelers to Egypt, who attributed three wonders to the country: the pyramids of Giza, chicken incubators, and balsam oil. Their accounts abound with stories about balm oil production in Maṭṭarīyya, which was a popular pilgrimage stop, as well as narrating the story of the well of the Virgin and her tree that still exist today.

Arielle Winnik (Bryn Mawr College)

Tiraz Textiles with Coptic Language Inscriptions in Medieval Islamic Egypt

Egyptian burials of the medieval Islamic Fatimid dynasty (969–1171)are characterised by shrouds of tiraz (inscribed textiles traditionally gifted by the caliph in recognition of political support). Scholars argue that the use of tiraz textiles in burials served a Shiite religious function, because the caliph, whose name featured on the textiles, was a source of Baraka (blessings). These shrouds provided protection from 'tortures of the grave,' including decaying flesh, crumbling bones, and agonising loneliness, which Islamic doctrine avowed the deceased could feel while they lay alone in the ground. Though associated with Shiite principles, tiraz shrouds were popular among Sunni Muslims and were even pervasive in the burials of Coptic Christians. The meaning of the shrouds in Christian burials was likely different, however, because Coptic Christians believed the deceased to be impervious to the hardships of burial. Christian souls separated from the confinement of interred corpses and existed in an extrasensory paradise, joining the otherworldly community of Christian dead.

This paper explores meanings of tiraz in Coptic burials. While identical shrouds could be used in Coptic and Islamic graves, I focus on an unusual group of tiraz that was linguistically and symbolically translated to accommodate Christian belief. These shrouds substitute Coptic-language inscriptions highlighting familial and communal ties for Arabic precedents. Through comprehensive translation of inscriptions and analysis of iconography and style, I show that Coptic tiraz adapted the protective functions of Islamic tiraz to comply with Christian doctrine by emphasising the deceased's everlasting membership in the Coptic community.

Miriam Ali-de-Unzaga (The Institute of Ismail Studies)

Exploring Muslim-Christian Coexistence Materialised on Fatimid and Andalusi Textiles

Islamic textiles constitute a paradigmatic media in which to problematise and assess the efficacy of the notion of crosspollination, as defined by Montgomery James. This paper present original research by examining a double crosspollination effect. By focusing on two textiles, one produced under the Fatimid dynasty, and one under an Andalusi dynasty, it will problematise their reuse or diversion into two different Christian religious contexts, illustrating to what extent Andalusi and Fatimid textile culture was not incompatible with Christian practices. The specificities of the textiles and the context in which they were produced, circulated and reused will be referred to by the term 'materialised coexistence'. A comparative approach, together with the tools provided by juxtaposing an anthropology of material culture enquiry with textual analysis, will provide a set of aspects that have tended to be neglected by previous scholars. This paper will offer a shift in the questions asked and insights to advance our understanding of the role of textiles and their effects in mediating cross-cultural encounters, contributing to debates of interfaith compatibilities, common values, and the notion of coexistence.

Nikolaos Vryzidis (British School at Athens)

Empires of Silk: Greek ecclesiastical use of Islamic textiles, 11th to 17th centuries –The traits of an ever-shifting pattern

My paper will offer a comparative overview of the ecclesiastical use of textiles from the Islamic World by focusing on textual sources and extant objects. It aims at tracing the traits of this ever-changing pattern, taking into account the different political and cultural frames conditioning this consumption. While there is evidence that Islamic art was generally coloured by the Byzantines with undertones of religious otherness, there also seem to be various nuances in the consumption of textiles, depending on provenance and the period's cultural sensibilities. For the Byzantine period the Church's consumption practices should be interpreted in relation to the secular aristocracy and the Constantinopolitan court. Ecclesiastical and secular art were communicating vessels to a certain extent, with elements circulating in both realms. Whether it was Egyptian or Persian textiles, it seems that the Church had no taboos in using them for its needs, just like the Byzantine aristocracy, and despite the occasional reactions. Then, from the second half of the 15th century there is again continuity, in the respect that the Church appropriates once more court aesthetic. The

meaning however inevitably changes, as now the fashions of the Ottomans, are adopted without the Byzantine aristocracy as the intermediary. Finally, my discussion will finish with Safavid textiles, and the information they may provide on the Church's cultural autonomy; as signifiers of its openness to luxury without its taste being monopolised by local products only.

Gunseli Gürel (Oxford University)

The Ottoman Representations of the Hagia Sophia in the Mid-Sixteenth century: A case study in the Ottoman approaches to the Graeco-Roman Heritage of Constantinople/Istanbul

Scholars of 'classical' Ottoman architecture have acknowledged that there was a conscious dialogue between the Hagia Sophia, the Byzantine imperial church built in 537 by emperor Justinian (r.527–565) in Constantinople, and Ottoman sultanic mosques built in the same city after its conquest by Mehmed II (r.1444–46, 1451–81) on 29 May 1453. Scholars have also noted that the dialogue that Mehmed II's mosque initiated (1463–70) was brought to a new level in the mosque of Süleyman I (1520–66), the Süleymaniye (1550–57), which not only emulated the design of the Hagia Sophia but also its construction process, as narrated in Byzantine and Ottoman textual sources. These Ottoman texts that narrate the construction of the Hagia Sophia, written from the 15th century onwards, were also products of this complex dialogue. They were often analysed as representing two ends of a pro- versus anti-imperialist debate involving the reign, first, of Mehmed II and then, almost a century later, of Süleyman I, without regarding the specific historical contexts that distinguished them. By contextualising and historicising some Ottoman accounts, which are representative of the period, and analysing their implications for the imperial buildings of Ottoman Constantinople, especially the Süleymaniye, this research argues that Ottoman representations of legacy of the Hagia Sophia as well as its appropriations in different landmarks were two related parts of an ever-changing process in historical context. Therefore, contextualising and historicising this process may deepen our knowledge of the Ottomans' engagement with the Roman-Byzantine past – which I aim to do in this research.

Remembering and Forgetting the Enlightenment

Hans-Christian Hönes (The Warburg Institute) hoenes@bilderfahrzeuge.org

Daniel Orrells (King's College London, Department of Classics) daniel.orrells@kcl.ac.uk

Art history is often considered a child of the Enlightenment: its methodological roots – aesthetics and historicism – are commonly associated with towering figures of the 18th century. Winckelmann and Kant loom large, and their influence on the development of the discipline is uncontested.

And yet, numerous art writers have been virtually forgotten, even though their contribution to and influence on 18th- and 19th-century discourses on art was probably just as important as the theories of the better-known German grandees. Pierre d'Hancarville or Jørgen Zoega are just two names, representative of those whose work has not stood the test of time. More often than not, these writers belong to what has been called the 'Super-Enlightenment': their thinking is infused with mystical and occult ideas and is often interested more in history and myth than in beauty and style.

That art history turned a blind eye might be surprising, given recent attempts to reinvigorate approaches open to 'unreason,' in order to develop new ways for explaining the power of images. The renaissance of the work of Aby Warburg is notable here. This session aims to evaluate these selection processes in the historiography and epistemology of art history and aesthetics: where and why do art historians, from the 18th to the 21st century, acknowledge the Enlightenment legacies of their discipline and when is it swept under the carpet? Does this canon formation in art history differ from other disciplines, such as classics and archaeology? Where has the 'Super-Enlightenment' left its traces in art historical thinking?

Katharina Boehm (University of Regensburg)

Enlightenment Objects and the Future of Historicism: Remembering antiquarianism

This paper returns to a key text of the British Enlightenment, Laurence Sterne's novel *The Life and Opinions of Tristram Shandy, Gentleman* (1759–67), in order to think about the place of antiquarianism in current debates about the need for a revised historicism in literary and cultural studies. My paper argues that the current tendency to use antiquarianism as a byword for naïve empiricism, for a simplistic belief in historical objectivity, and for hostility to theory and abstraction obscures the rich history of object-oriented historical research as a motor of sophisticated theoretical thinking about the past and its relationship to the present. Sterne's novel helps us to rethink the legacy of 18th-century antiquarian approaches to the past. The novel's representation of the material traces of the past registers the costs of what Horkheimer and Adorno have described as the 'disenchantment of the world' by the knowledge projects of the Enlightenment. However, Sterne also uses the famous military re-enactments that two characters stage on the bowling-green of Shandy Hall in order to explore a mode of antiquarian inquiry that is focused on the performative production of the past in the present, rather than on the amassing of petrified 'facts'. I read the bowling-green re-enactments and the assemblages of objects that they draw into their orbit as an experiment in

historical cognition. In doing so, I place the mimetic regime of the re-enactments in dialogue with Walter Benjamin's concept of mimesis and with Bruno Latour's thinking about 'matters of concern'.

Lindsay Allen (King's College London)

The Lost World of Persian Antiquity in the 18th Century

This paper will address the overlooked prehistory of Assyriology in the Enlightenment intellectual landscape. Scarce cuneiform characters circulated among European literati from the 1690s to 1800; their juxtaposition with a surge in Indo-Iranian studies enabled a creative catalytic conversion of Achaemenid inscriptions into a (once-more) functional threshold to Near Eastern history. After c1840, the dominance of newly read texts and the narratives they produced served to erase the Persian prehistory of ancient Near Eastern scholarship. A reappraisal of this lost, imagined antiquity questions the distinction between sense and non-sense in historical experimentation and assesses the disciplinary consequences for Achaemenid history.

Katherine Harloe (Reading)

Sacred History, Art and Myth in the Enlightenment: CG Heyne and the 'archaeology' of Greece

Christian Gottlob Heyne, who held the chair of Eloquence and Poetry at Göttingen for half a century from 1763, is as good candidate as any for a forgotten Enlightenment art writer. Long erased from grand narratives of the 18th-century origins of aesthetics and historicism, and subject even within his lifetime of a malicious *damnatio memoriae* conducted by his former students, Heyne nevertheless merits a place in any genealogy of the disciplinisation and institutionalisation of art history. From his early work interpreting gems, to his intellectual relationship with Herder and his Göttingen lectures on 'Archäologie der Kunst des Alterthums', which attracted an audience of significant figures (the Schlegels, Creuzer, Goethe, Humboldt) and prompted Göttingen to purchase the first university cast collection in the German lands, Heyne provided a significant stimulus to the study of ancient art in Germany, and a channel for the dissemination of Winckelmannian aesthetic ideas. This paper examines Heyne's approach to ancient art in the context of his studies in mythography, another field in which his contributions were significant. Heyne's mythographic works were motivated by the desire to advance iconographic analyses of ancient artworks, but also to reconstruct early stages of human culture: an interest that brought him into contact, often critical, with 'Super-Enlightenment' thought. The paper will examine this relation; if time permits it will also include discussion of the impact of Heyne's thought on two of his pupils: Friedrich Creuzer and Jørgen Zoega.

Christina Contandriopoulos (UQAM University)

Shifting the Origins of Architecture: Primitive monuments and fertility cults in antiquarian collections (1785–1805)

The quest for origins is a central theme in the historiography of 18th-century architecture. Among the many paths traced backwards are a fascinating collection of little-known publications that sought to explain the origins of architecture in terms of sexuality and phallic cults. In the final decades of the 18th century, the discovery of ancient cippis, menhirs and other primitive stone monuments in Europe and Asia inspired a new generation of British and French antiquarians that included Pierre-Hughes d'Hancarville, Richard Payne Knight, Jean-Louis Viel de Saint-Maux and Jacques-Antoine Dulaure. These men rallied against the classical narratives of the origins of architecture as inherited from Vitruvius – rejecting the notion of architecture as an imitative art which, like painting and sculpture, derived its forms from nature. These antiquarians argued for the primacy of symbolical monuments based not on imitation but rather on fertility cults and representations of sexual organs. I will focus on a corpus of engravings from infamous antiquarian collections dating from 1785 to 1805. These illustrated books have been despised and ridiculed since their publication especially amongst philosophers and art historians. I will give an overview of the main arguments that help explain this rejection. Of particular interest is the way in which print culture participated in a new interest for primitivism at the end of the 18th century. I will highlight the legacy of some of these engravings that made their way into mainstream architectural publications in the 19th century to great effect. Once detached from their context and fixed into provocative engravings, these raised stones appeared as new emblems of modernity radically freed from the burdens of history.

Helene Seewald (TU Berlin)

Outline Drawings: The forgotten chapter of art history

Outline drawings are widely perceived as a product of the Classical period. They are usually associated with the publication of the second collection of antiquities from the cabinet of Sir William Hamilton or with the famous works by John Flaxman. The fact that outline drawings were one of the most important instruments for the development of art history has mostly been forgotten. In the Age of Enlightenment, outline drawings became a very important medium for the dissemination of knowledge. They were models, which means they resulted from a process of abstraction but nevertheless contained precise information about the subject they described. In the 18th century, outline drawings were used in every scientific field, from medicine to architecture – and equally in the new sciences of art history and archaeology.

Besides the great recueils, of which only few copies were produced at the beginning of the 18th century (like recueil Crozat or recueil Jullienne), outline drawings were the first images to be used for conveying art historical content, not only to an expert audience, like artists and connoisseurs, but also to the general public.

In my talk I would like to show some of the first outline drawings used in an art historical context, to indicate their origin by tracing the influence of other sciences and to share some insights on why art historians in the 19th century already turned away from outlines as a relevant instrument for studying art history.

Susanna Pettersson (Ateneum Art Museum / Finnish National Gallery)

The Nordic art journal: Writing new art history

History of art history is famous for the names of individual scholars. Less attention has been paid to scholar groups, especially those who were considered to be at the margin. My Nordic example takes us to the heart of the formation of art history in the Nordic countries in the 1870s.

The key example is a new art journal *Tidskrift för bildande konst och konstindustri* (*Journal of Fine Arts and Arts And Crafts*) that was published in Stockholm in 1875–1876. The journal was established right after the 1873 art historians' conference in Vienna and the driving ideological force was the idea of enlightenment. The editor-in-chief of the bimonthly journal was art scholar Lorentz Dietrichson (1834– 1817), and the permanent editorial team consisted of members from Sweden, Norway, Denmark and Finland: Professors Carl Rupert Nyblom (Uppsala), G Ljungren (Lund), Marcus Jacob Monrad (Kristiania), Carl Gustaf Estlander (Helsinki) and adjunct professor Julius Lange (Copenhagen). Every member was a prominent scholar of his own time and had published widely.

I will argue that the new journal provided the Nordic authors with a platform to manifest their concept of art history: what was valued within the arts and especially why. It can be claimed that the journal showcased in its short term of existence Nordic art to the wider public, and became a statement that still today gives us an idea of what was considered valuable and important within the arts in the mid-1870s.

C. Oliver O'Donnell (KHI Florence)

Transcendental Visual Experience in 19th-Century American Art and Art History

In late 19th century America, when Charles Eliot Norton assumed what is often described as the first formal professorship of art history in the United States, raw, unmediated, visual experience had become as associated with the mystical meditations of the American transcendentalists as with the sceptical empiricisms of the Enlightenment. During Norton's youth, the fame of Ralph Waldo Emerson had ironically transformed the very name of Immanuel Kant's high-Enlightenment philosophical method into a sobriquet for a new mode of religiosity. And as the loyal son of one of Emerson's fiercest critics, Norton would struggle with radical, transcendentalist ideas throughout his life. This complex intellectual nexus helps explain why the descriptions of works of art in Norton's scholarship tend to focus on the iconographic content of art objects and are more directed toward imaginative reconstructions of what a work looked like at a given historical moment than toward the immediate visual qualities before Norton's eyes. For Norton, long descriptions of his immediate visual

experience seem to have been as essential as they were dangerous. This paper puts forward an interpretation of Norton's approach to visual experience by comparing his practice of *ekphrasis* to Emerson's and by comparing drawings made by some of Norton's closest followers to drawings made by Transcendentalists. Taken together, this paper argues that these descriptions and drawings dramatise evolving conceptions of visual experience itself and of the empirical mandates so central to art history as a discipline that is prone to both embrace and eschew its Enlightenment foundations.

Sandrine Canac (Stony Brook University)

Square Pegs in Round Holes. Robert Barry's anti-rationalist project

Conceptual art has mostly been historicised as a distant heir of the Enlightenment project, hinging on rational discourses and emulating scientific methods. However, a closer look at the explorations in the nature of consciousness of American artist Robert Barry (b 1936) will complicate such readings and offer a contemporary perspective on issues that have opposed the Enlightenment to the Super-Enlightenment. Neither rational nor irrational, Barry's anti-rationalist project invites the viewer to pause and ponder the nature of what cannot be seen.

This paper will show how Barry's practice does not subscribe to Joseph Kosuth and Art & Language's classical model of reason, yet does not entirely fall into the realm of the paraconceptual, which Alexandra Kokoli describes as 'an arena of both danger and possibility that threatens to lure the spectator/reader astray, to deceive her into sidestepping the issue at hand. [It is] an uncanny practice par excellence, not simply because of its adjacency to the paranormal, but thanks to its evocation of the repressed periphery of culture.' Through works that invoke the space of an absence, or use language to touch upon the unknown, Barry's oeuvre provides a nuanced critique of reason and of the enlightenment project by pointing at the limit of the knowable.

The Politics and Aesthetics of Error

Martin Lang, University of Lincoln, mlang@lincoln.ac.uk

Tom Grimwood, University of Cumbria, tom.grimwood@cumbria.ac.uk

Responding to the election of George W Bush, the 'war on terror' and subsequent domestic anti-terror legislation, art activists declared that we were living in a time of political, economic and environmental error. The Errorist International was established to embrace error and establish an 'international network' in its name. Conversely, the Clandestine Insurgent Rebel Clown Army (CIRCA) waged a 'war on error', referring to G8 politicians as the 'world's most dangerous "errorists"'.

These interventions reflected a long-standing relationship between art and error. For example, psychoanalytic interpretations of the gaffe or the slip of the tongue provided the inspiration for Surrealist automatic writing and the production of 'exquisite corpses'; or the field of 'glitch aesthetics', which explores artistic possibilities that arise from random computer or electronic malfunction.

Recent political developments in Britain and the USA invite accusations of a politics driven by error ('misinformed' voters, 'post-truth' politicians, 'fake news' agencies etc.). This interdisciplinary session discusses how error has, can or might be addressed aesthetically, philosophically and politically, in order to explore possible roles for aesthetics in interpreting political error, and the political ramifications of aesthetic error. The papers draw on a range of contexts and conceptualizations of error, and the session will conclude with a roundtable discussion exploring the role of error in critique, disruption, and the potential for alternative politics.

Ileana Parvu (Geneva School of Art and Design)

Errors and Making Badly. The politics of Ion Grigorescu's faulty technique

The Romanian artist Ion Grigorescu started to work in the 1970s under Ceausescu's rule. In 1980, at the request of the Communist Party, he had to pay tribute to the president by painting his portrait. The painting was rejected by a jury, who considered that there were many mistakes in the way Ceausescu was portrayed. My paper examines the articulation between error and politics in Grigorescu's work. It understands the word 'error' not only as a punctual mistake (as in Ceausescu's portrait painted by the artist), but also more broadly as working with deliberate technical mistakes. Grigorescu's 1978 film entitled *Dialogue with Ceausescu* can be seen for instance as a technical failure: the two characters don't seem to speak with each other and the superimposed transcription of their dialogue is impossible to read. His other films and photographs also seem to be badly made.

I will demonstrate that 'making badly' has in this case a political, albeit secret, function. In order to examine the political dimension of Grigorescu's work, I will consider its faulty technique in relation to two elements. On the one hand, I will set Grigorescu's technical failure

against the ugliness of everyday objects in Communist Romania. On the other, I will draw a comparison between the realist depiction of Grigorescu's works and the embellishment of Romanian reality in the Socialist realist official paintings. I will argue that Grigorescu's intentional technical defects give his work a dated aspect that enables the viewer to put some distance between the present made of Ceausescu's oppressive rule and the possibility of a different near future.

Kyveli Lignou-Tsamantani (University of York)

Visible and Invisible 'Frames': Towards a consideration of representations of 'political errors' in the 21st-century refugee crisis

This paper will examine the representation of 'political errors' regarding the refugee crisis that Europe has witnessed since 2010, by focusing on the video installation of the artist Ina Lounguine, *Staring Quietly at the Backwash*, 2016. In this video the viewers see two overlapping frames – one of politicians' handshakes superimposed on another of a sea – while hearing the voices and noises of refugees on a floating boat. The visual experience highlights the cause of this disastrous situation: the 'political errors'. By taking Lounguine's work as a focal point, this paper will seek to explore whether the challenge of contemporary visibility can create a more effective process of spectatorship in terms of recognising 'political errors' and visual politics. While conceptual artistic practices, from their early stages, are based on the disrupted relation between what is seen and what is read (image–words relation), in the case of this video the disruption emerges between the visible and the audible, a relation that might cause discomfort or even anger in the viewers. Is making the disaster itself invisible – but indicating it visually with a covered 'frame' – an effective means of making contemporary viewers recognise the political responsibilities regarding these contemporary crises? And finally, how do such abstract aesthetics of representing 'political errors' relate to the politics of contemporary 'iconisms' and documentary photography aesthetics?

Steve Klee (University of Lincoln)

An Aesthetics of Objectivity

When the new White House administration's position on climate change is that 'it is a bunch of bunk', then the defence of scientific objectivity is an urgent necessity. A distrust of the justified authority represented by science is central to our politically disastrous post-truth condition.

My claim is that art can (and should) resist this post-truth situation by defending the possibility of objective thought. In order for it to do so effectively, however, certain theoretical suppositions within contemporary aesthetics need to be reformatted. A current and dominant model of art interpretation, one deriving from the influential philosophy of Jacques Rancière, is set against the possibility of objective thought. Claims to objectivity, for Rancière, are never justified, they are always instances of insidious power discourse. In short, objectivity is

impossible, or in other words, ones appropriate for this panel, error is inevitable. And, in fact, art interpretation is posited as one mode wherein this inevitable error is revealed.

For Rancière it is the spectator's experience of art's 'indeterminacy' that reveals the impossibility of objectivity. This revelation is aligned to a leftist politics, one with much to admire, but inadequate to our post-truth era. This is because his art-politics serves to discredit and disarm scientific knowledge in a manner very similar to the post-truth position. I propose a radical rearranging of Rancière's system so that the indeterminacy of art is framed according to the process of scientific concept revision, in which theories are improved under strict experimental methodology.

Arsalan Rafique (Independent)

On Fortifying a Paranoid City: Pakistan and security errors in times of perpetual conflict

In the era of urbanised armed conflicts, cities are desperately attempting to deter any scale or form of post-modern violence. But the evolution of threat, so far, has been much greater than the mechanisms developed to cope with them. Cities in Pakistan are embroiled in a perpetual conflict due to the country's role in the global and local conflicts. Positing life itself as war, fear is marketed as an anticipation of violence, becoming an intrinsic part of urban environments The spatial-security measures deployed by the state and the people to create a sense of safety have not only been largely ad-hoc and improvisational, but in a way have proven detrimental. The public realm is shrinking fast, with barricades and security measures rigorously rendering parks, plazas and other institutional and public spaces inaccessible. What results from this incessant exclusion is a regime of heightened anxiety. Both the threat and the threatened are now outside the 'Safe Zones', turning the right to safety and tranquillity into a prized commodity.

This paper aims to identify the complicit nature of both the perpetrators and the state security mechanism in creating the state of insecurity in Pakistani Cities. By mapping the extent of encroachments and critically studying the impact of ever-increasing securitization, the paper will identify the elastic geographies the public creates to circumvent security in order to preserve the sense of civic normality in these cities.

Raquel Wilner (The Courtauld Institute of Art)

Pareidolia as an Explanation for the Misperception of Hidden Images in Art

Pareidolia is the tendency to find patterns where none exist, the most common example of which is to perceive faces in clouds. This is an evolved trait, which makes humans more prone to detect false positives. In art history, we sometimes discover hidden images within a picture and conduct a subjective introspective analysis of the painter's motivation behind these images. A psychoanalytic approach is often employed, giving the artist an unconscious drive that led the artist to paint hidden images without conscious awareness. I argue that highly ambiguous hidden images are better explained as pareidolia effects rather than acting

as evidence for the artist's inner mind. The arguments brought forth by Sidney Geist and Dario Gamboni, on hidden images in paintings by Cézanne and Gauguin respectively, illustrate potential risks of subjective visual analysis and how a perceptual phenomenon in our brain can lead to erroneous conclusions. When analysing ambiguous images within pictures, it is important to establish pictorial intent: did the artist deliberately paint the hidden image, or is it merely a perceptual artefact? If we neglect this consideration, we become subject to a risk of discussing images that are actually not present, and that do not represent any knowledge about either the picture or the artist.

Michael Pinchbeck (University of Lincoln)

Errors of Memory, Memories of Error: Slip-roads and pit-stops on The Long and Winding Road

This paper distils five years of practice and 20 years of loss into 25 minutes. From 2004–09, I toured a one-to-one performance in a car. Passengers were invited to fasten their seat belts and join me for a travel sweet as I shared the reason for the journey via the rear-view mirror. The narrative of the performance was the journey of auto-recovery I made following my brother's death on 17 May 1998, as the car was dented, damaged, written off and towed for five years. On 17 May 2009, I presented the final one-to-one performance at The Bluecoat (Liverpool) and immersed the car in the River Mersey to mark the end of the road. It was both a baptism and a drowning. The car and its contents were then crushed. In March 2010, the remains of the car were discarded in Michael Landy's Art Bin at the South London Gallery and then deposited in landfill. The only criteria for acceptance into the Art Bin was that the artwork had to be deemed a failure. I argued that if the project was intended to repair the damage left behind by loss then it had failed. The submission was accepted. This paper explores the erroring of memory implicit in auto-biographical projects as creative mistakes were embraced and the car's breakdown was retro-engineered into an act of catharsis. As Cage said, 'there is no mistake, only make'. As Beckett wrote, 'Fail. Fail again. Fail better'. The project memorialised my loss and commemorated errors.